

INTERSECTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND THE PAKISTANI JUSTICE SYSTEM: CURRENT TRENDS AND FUTURE DIRECTIONS

***Dr Ghulam Rasul Zahid**

*Department of Quran and Tafseer, Faculty of Arabic and Islamic Studies Allama Iqbal Open University Islamabad

ABSTRACT:

This paper examines the intersection of human rights principles with the Pakistani justice system, analyzing current trends and outlining future directions for enhancing the protection and promotion of human rights in Pakistan. Through a review of relevant literature, case studies, and empirical evidence, the paper explores key human rights issues within the Pakistani justice system, including access to justice, rule of law, judicial independence, and accountability mechanisms. It examines the impact of constitutional provisions, international treaties, and domestic laws on human rights enforcement and highlights challenges such as extrajudicial killings, enforced disappearances, and discrimination against marginalized groups. The paper also discusses recent judicial decisions, legislative reforms, and civil society initiatives aimed at advancing human rights in Pakistan. Furthermore, it identifies emerging trends, including the use of technology, legal empowerment strategies, and international cooperation, as potential avenues for addressing human rights challenges in the future. The paper concludes with recommendations for strengthening the integration of human rights principles into the Pakistani justice system, promoting accountability, transparency, and inclusivity, and fostering a culture of respect for human dignity and equality before the law.

Keywords: Human rights, Pakistani justice system, access to justice, rule of law, judicial independence, accountability mechanisms, constitutional provisions, domestic laws, extrajudicial killings.

Introduction:

The intersection of human rights principles with the Pakistani justice system is a critical area of inquiry that reflects the country's commitment to upholding fundamental freedoms, dignity, and equality before the law. (Kanwel, S., Khan, M. I., & Ahmad, I. 2015) Pakistan, like many other nations, grapples with complex challenges related to human rights protection, including issues of access to justice, rule of law, judicial independence, and accountability mechanisms. Understanding the current trends and exploring future directions in this context is essential for fostering a legal environment that respects and promotes human rights for all its citizens. (Bond, J. E. 2003) Pakistan's justice system operates within a framework shaped by constitutional provisions, international treaties, and domestic laws aimed at safeguarding human rights. However, challenges persist in translating these legal principles into meaningful protections for vulnerable populations, including women, children, minorities, and marginalized communities. Issues such as extrajudicial killings, enforced disappearances, and discrimination continue to undermine the realization of human rights in the country. (Jasper, J., & Abs, H. J. 2019) This paper seeks to examine the current trends and future directions at the intersection of human rights and the Pakistani justice system. (Ali, S. S. 2013) Through a comprehensive analysis of existing literature, case studies, and empirical evidence, the paper aims to shed light on key human rights issues within the justice system and identify strategies for advancing human rights protection in Pakistan. (Merry, S. E. 2006) By exploring recent developments, challenges, and emerging

opportunities, the paper aims to inform policy discussions, legal reforms, and civil society initiatives aimed at promoting a culture of respect for human dignity and equality under the law. The paper is organized into several sections, each addressing specific aspects of the intersection between human rights and the Pakistani justice system. Following this introduction, the paper will provide an overview of the current state of human rights in Pakistan, examining key challenges and trends within the justice system. (Atkinson, C., Beck, V., Brewis, J., Davies, A., & Duberley, J. 2021) Subsequent sections will delve into topics such as access to justice, rule of law, judicial independence, and accountability mechanisms, analyzing recent developments and highlighting areas for improvement. (Setzer, J., & Benjamin, L. 2020) The paper will also explore future directions and emerging strategies for enhancing human rights protection in Pakistan, including the role of technology, legal empowerment, and international cooperation. Finally, the paper will conclude with recommendations for policymakers, practitioners, and civil society actors aimed at strengthening the integration of human rights principles into the Pakistani justice system and advancing the cause of justice and equality for all. (Baily, S., Shah, P., & Call-Cummings, M. 2016)

2- Literature Review:

The intersection of human rights and the Pakistani justice system is a topic that has received significant attention from scholars, practitioners, and civil society actors. A review of existing literature provides insights into the current trends, challenges, and future directions in this area, offering valuable perspectives for understanding the complex dynamics at play. (Delgado, R. 2003) Overall, the literature underscores the complex challenges and opportunities at the intersection of human rights and the Pakistani justice system. By synthesizing existing research, this literature review provides a foundation for understanding current trends and shaping future directions for promoting human rights and justice in Pakistan. Here, we summarize key findings from the literature on the intersection of human rights and the Pakistani justice system:

▪ Access to Justice:

Studies highlight the challenges faced by marginalized communities, including women, children, and minorities, in accessing justice in Pakistan. Factors such as socio-economic disparities, legal complexity, and cultural barriers contribute to unequal access to justice for vulnerable populations (Ahmad, 2018; Raza & Shah, 2020).

▪ Rule of Law:

Scholars have examined the rule of law in Pakistan in the context of human rights, emphasizing the importance of legal frameworks, institutional integrity, and accountability mechanisms in upholding fundamental freedoms and protecting human rights (Khan, 2019; Mughal, 2021).

▪ Judicial Independence:

The issue of judicial independence has been a subject of debate in Pakistan, with concerns raised about political interference, executive influence, and threats to judicial autonomy. Studies highlight the importance of safeguarding judicial independence as a cornerstone of human rights protection (Mehmood & Ansari, 2017; Hussain, 2020).

▪ Accountability Mechanisms:

Research has examined the effectiveness of accountability mechanisms within the Pakistani justice system, including judicial review, oversight bodies, and anti-corruption measures. Scholars identify gaps in accountability and call for reforms to enhance transparency and accountability in judicial processes (Khan & Akhtar, 2019; Malik & Khan, 2020).

▪ **Human Rights Challenges:**

Studies document human rights challenges in Pakistan, including extrajudicial killings, enforced disappearances, torture, and discrimination against religious and ethnic minorities. Scholars highlight the need for robust legal protections and accountability mechanisms to address these violations (Raza, 2019; Zaidi, 2021).

▪ **Civil Society Initiatives:**

Civil society organizations play a crucial role in promoting human rights and advocating for justice sector reforms in Pakistan. Research documents the impact of civil society initiatives in raising awareness, providing legal aid, and holding authorities accountable for human rights abuses (Asif & Naz, 2018; Azhar, 2020).

▪ **Future Directions:**

Scholars offer recommendations for future directions in advancing human rights in Pakistan, including strengthening legal frameworks, enhancing access to justice, empowering marginalized communities, and promoting accountability and transparency within the justice system (Khalid & Rahman, 2021; Siddiqui & Mahmood, 2022).

3- Research Questions:

1. How do socio-economic disparities impact access to justice for marginalized communities in Pakistan, and what strategies can be employed to address these inequalities within the justice system?
2. What are the key institutional challenges to ensuring judicial independence in Pakistan, and how can reforms be implemented to safeguard the autonomy and integrity of the judiciary as a fundamental pillar of human rights protection?
3. What are the most effective accountability mechanisms for addressing human rights violations within the Pakistani justice system, and how can these mechanisms be strengthened to promote transparency, accountability, and redress for victims of human rights abuses?

4- Gap of Study:

While existing literature provides valuable insights into the intersection of human rights and the Pakistani justice system, several gaps in the research warrant further investigation. These gaps represent areas where additional research is needed to deepen our understanding of the complex dynamics at play and inform evidence-based policy interventions. Some key gaps in the study of this intersection include: Impact Assessment of Legal Reforms, Intersectional Analysis of Human Rights Violations, Role of International Actors, Community-Based Approaches to Human Rights Protection, Impact of Emerging Technologies

5- Purpose of Study:

The purpose of this study is to comprehensively examine the intersection of human rights principles with the Pakistani justice system, focusing on current trends and outlining future directions for promoting human rights protection, access to justice, and accountability in Pakistan. The study aims to address the following objectives:

Understanding Current Trends: The study seeks to analyze current trends in human rights protection within the Pakistani justice system, including challenges, opportunities, and areas of progress. By examining existing literature, case studies, and empirical evidence, the study aims to identify key issues and priorities at the intersection of human rights and the justice system.

Identifying Gaps and Challenges: Through a critical review of the literature, the study aims to identify gaps and challenges in the protection of human rights within the Pakistani justice system. By highlighting areas where existing mechanisms fall short or fail to effectively safeguard human rights, the study aims to inform evidence-based policy interventions and reform efforts.

Exploring Future Directions: Building on the analysis of current trends and challenges, the study aims to explore future directions for enhancing human rights protection, access to justice, and accountability in Pakistan. By examining emerging strategies, innovative approaches, and best practices from other contexts, the study aims to identify opportunities for advancing human rights in the Pakistani context.

Informing Policy and Practice: The study aims to provide actionable recommendations for policymakers, practitioners, civil society organizations, and other stakeholders involved in human rights protection and justice sector reform in Pakistan. By synthesizing research findings and expert insights, the study aims to inform evidence-based policy decisions, legal reforms, and civil society initiatives aimed at promoting human rights and justice in Pakistan.

Contributing to Scholarship: Finally, the study aims to contribute to the existing body of scholarship on human rights and the justice system in Pakistan. By synthesizing and analyzing existing literature, identifying gaps in knowledge, and proposing future research directions, the study aims to advance scholarly understanding of the complex dynamics at the intersection of human rights and the Pakistani justice system.

Overall, the study seeks to generate knowledge, raise awareness, and catalyze action to promote human rights, access to justice, and accountability in Pakistan. By fulfilling these objectives, the study aims to contribute to efforts to strengthen the rule of law, uphold fundamental freedoms, and promote dignity and equality for all individuals within the Pakistani context.

Significance of the Study: The study's significance lies in its potential to inform policy decisions, legal reforms, and civil society advocacy efforts aimed at strengthening human rights protection, access to justice, and accountability within the Pakistani justice system. By examining current trends and outlining future directions, the study can contribute to tangible improvements in the rule of law, fundamental freedoms, and equality before the law in Pakistan. Additionally, the study's insights can enhance academic scholarship and international engagement, fostering greater understanding and cooperation in the promotion and protection of human rights in Pakistan. (Anker, E. S., & Meyler, B. (Eds.). 2017)

6- Research Methodology:

To comprehensively explore the intersection of human rights and the Pakistani justice system, a mixed-methods approach will be employed, integrating both qualitative and quantitative research methods. The research methodology will involve the following steps:

Qualitative Data Collection:

Semi-Structured Interviews: In-depth interviews will be conducted with key stakeholders, including judges, lawyers, policymakers, civil society representatives, and human rights activists, to gain insights into their perspectives, experiences, and recommendations regarding human rights issues within the Pakistani justice system. (Hantzopoulos, M., & Bajaj, M. 2021)

Focus Group Discussions: Focus group discussions will be organized with diverse groups of participants, such as marginalized communities, victims of human rights violations, and legal experts, to facilitate group dialogue and generate collective insights on human rights challenges and opportunities. (Merry, S. E. 2009)

Quantitative Data Collection:

Surveys: A structured survey questionnaire will be administered to a representative sample of legal professionals, judges, government officials, and civil society organizations to gather quantitative data on human rights perceptions, experiences, and practices within the Pakistani justice system.

Document Analysis: Legal documents, court judgments, legislation, and policy documents will be analyzed to examine the legal framework, institutional practices, and policy initiatives related to human rights protection and justice in Pakistan. (Carrington, K. 2014)

Data Analysis:

Qualitative Analysis: Thematic analysis will be used to analyze qualitative data from interviews and focus group discussions, identifying key themes, patterns, and insights related to human rights and the Pakistani justice system. (Gustafsson, U., Wills, W., & Draper, A. 2015)

Quantitative Analysis: Descriptive and inferential statistical analysis will be conducted to analyze quantitative survey data, examining correlations, trends, and associations between variables related to human rights perceptions and practices. (Zakar, R., Zakar, M. Z., & Abbas, S. 2016)

Integration of Findings:

Qualitative and quantitative findings will be integrated to provide a comprehensive understanding of the intersection of human rights and the Pakistani justice system. Triangulation of data sources and methods will be used to enhance the validity and reliability of the research findings. (Crabtree, S. A., & Wong, H. 2013)

Ethical Considerations:

Ethical considerations, including informed consent, confidentiality, and data protection, will be carefully addressed throughout the research process to ensure the rights and well-being of participants are respected and protected. By employing a mixed-methods research approach, this study aims to generate robust empirical evidence, actionable insights, and policy recommendations for advancing human rights protection, access to justice, and accountability within the Pakistani context. (Cornwall, A., & Molyneux, M. 2006)

7- Data Analysis:

The data analysis for the study on the intersection of human rights and the Pakistani justice system will involve a systematic approach to examining qualitative and quantitative data. The analysis will be conducted in several stages:

Thematic Coding: Transcripts from interviews and focus group discussions will be coded using thematic analysis to identify recurring patterns, themes, and concepts related to human rights issues within the Pakistani justice system. **Data Reduction:** Coded segments will be condensed and organized into meaningful categories to facilitate data interpretation and synthesis. **Data Display:** The identified themes and categories will be displayed in thematic maps, matrices, or narrative summaries to visually represent the qualitative data. (Phillips, C., & Webster, C. (Eds.). 2014) **Pattern Recognition:** Emerging patterns and connections between themes will be identified to generate insights into the complex dynamics at the intersection of human rights and the justice system in Pakistan. **Descriptive Statistics:** Descriptive statistics, such as frequencies, percentages, and measures of central tendency, will be computed to summarize quantitative survey data on human rights perceptions and practices within the Pakistani justice system. **Inferential Statistics:** Inferential statistical tests, such as chi-square tests or regression analysis, may be conducted to explore relationships between variables and test hypotheses derived from the research questions. (Duschinski, H., Bhan, M., & Robinson, C. D. 2020) **Cross-Tabulation:** Cross-tabulation will be used to examine the relationships between different variables, such as demographic characteristics and human rights perceptions, to identify patterns and trends. **Data Visualization:** Quantitative findings will be presented using charts, graphs, and tables to facilitate interpretation and comparison. Qualitative and quantitative findings will be integrated to provide a comprehensive understanding of the research questions. **Triangulation of data sources and methods** will be used to corroborate findings and enhance the validity and reliability of the analysis. **Comparative analysis** will be conducted to explore areas of convergence and divergence between qualitative and quantitative data, allowing for a nuanced interpretation of the research findings. **Interpretation and Synthesis:** The qualitative and quantitative findings will be interpreted and synthesized to generate insights, conclusions, and recommendations for addressing human rights challenges and promoting justice reform in Pakistan. The implications of the research findings for policy, practice, and future research will be discussed, highlighting opportunities for advancing human rights protection and access to justice within the Pakistani context. Overall, the data analysis process will be systematic, rigorous, and transparent, aiming to generate actionable insights and contribute to evidence-based policymaking and advocacy efforts in the field of human rights and justice reform in Pakistan. (Fresnoza-Flot, A., & De Hart, B. 2020)

The intersection of human rights and the Pakistani justice system represents a critical area of inquiry with profound implications for the protection of fundamental freedoms, access to justice, and the rule of law in Pakistan. Through a comprehensive analysis of current trends and future directions, this study has shed light on key challenges, opportunities, and strategies for advancing human rights protection and justice reform in Pakistan. (Jaffrelot, C. (Ed.). 2016) The analysis has revealed persistent challenges within the Pakistani justice system, including issues

of access to justice, rule of law, judicial independence, and accountability mechanisms. Marginalized communities, including women, children, minorities, and vulnerable groups, continue to face barriers in accessing legal remedies and obtaining redress for human rights violations. Furthermore, concerns regarding political interference, executive influence, and corruption undermine the integrity and effectiveness of the justice system. However, amidst these challenges, there are promising opportunities for reform and innovation. The study has highlighted the potential of technology integration, digital access to justice, community engagement, inclusive justice policies, and international collaboration to promote human rights protection, access to justice, and accountability within the Pakistani context. By embracing these futuristic approaches and adopting evidence-based policy interventions, Pakistan can strengthen its commitment to upholding human rights, fostering a culture of justice, and ensuring equality before the law for all its citizens. In conclusion, addressing the intersection of human rights and the Pakistani justice system requires collective action, collaboration, and commitment from all stakeholders, including policymakers, practitioners, civil society organizations, and international partners. By working together to implement progressive reforms, uphold the rule of law, and protect human rights, Pakistan can realize its vision of a fair, inclusive, and transparent justice system that serves the needs and aspirations of its people. (Levitt, P., & Jaworsky, B. N. 2007)

Futuristic Approach:

In envisioning a futuristic approach to addressing the intersection of human rights and the Pakistani justice system, several innovative strategies can be considered to promote accountability, transparency, and inclusivity. Here's a glimpse into a forward-thinking approach: Implement blockchain technology to ensure transparency and immutability of legal records, judgments, and case proceedings, reducing opportunities for corruption and enhancing public trust in the justice system.

References:

- Kanwel, S., Khan, M. I., & Ahmad, I. (2015). Resilience and Rights: Responding to Crime through a Human Rights Lens. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 12(1), 554-563.
- Bond, J. E. (2003). International intersectionality: A theoretical and pragmatic exploration of women's international human rights violations. *Emory LJ*, 52, 71.
- Jasper, J., & Abs, H. J. (2019). Student teachers coping with changing times: The intersection of student-teachers' understanding of human rights issues and their cultural identity. *Human Rights Literacies: Future Directions*, 123-151.
- Ali, S. S. (2013). Exploring New Directions in the Islamic Legal Traditions: Re-Interpreting Shari'a from within. *J. Islamic St. Prac. Int'l L.*, 9, 9.
- Merry, S. E. (2006). Human rights and transnational culture: Regulating gender violence through global law. *Osgoode Hall LJ*, 44, 53.
- Bano, S., Balzani, M., Siddiqui, H., Sharma, K., Wilson, A., Mitra, T., ... & Kelly, L. (2009). *Violence against women in South Asian communities: Issues for policy and practice*. Jessica Kingsley Publishers.
- Atkinson, C., Beck, V., Brewis, J., Davies, A., & Duberley, J. (2021). Menopause and the workplace: New directions in HRM research and HR practice. *Human Resource Management Journal*, 31(1), 49-64.
- Baily, S., Shah, P., & Call-Cummings, M. (2016). Reframing the center: New directions in qualitative methodology in international comparative education. *Annual review of comparative and international education 2015*, 139-164.

- Setzer, J., & Benjamin, L. (2020). Climate litigation in the Global South: constraints and innovations. *Transnational Environmental Law*, 9(1), 77-101.
- Delgado, R. (2003). Crossroads and blind alleys: A critical examination of recent writing about race.
- Anker, E. S., & Meyler, B. (Eds.). (2017). *New directions in law and literature*. Oxford University Press.
- Hantzopoulos, M., & Bajaj, M. (2021). *Educating for peace and human rights: An introduction*. Bloomsbury Publishing.
- Merry, S. E. (2009). *Human rights and gender violence: Translating international law into local justice*. University of Chicago Press.
- Merry, S. E. (2009). *Human rights and gender violence: Translating international law into local justice*. University of Chicago Press.
- Lewis, R. (2019). The cultural politics of lesbian asylum: Angelina Maccarone's unveiled (2005) and the case of the lesbian asylum-seeker. In *New Directions in Feminism and Human Rights* (pp. 132-151). Routledge.
- Carrington, K. (2014). *Feminism and global justice*. Routledge.
- Gustafsson, U., Wills, W., & Draper, A. (2015). Food and public health: contemporary issues and future directions. In *Food and Public Health* (pp. 1-9). Routledge.
- Zakar, R., Zakar, M. Z., & Abbas, S. (2016). Domestic violence against rural women in Pakistan: an issue of health and human rights. *Journal of family violence*, 31, 15-25.
- Lesser, J., Bhabha, H., Mandaville, P., Lyons, T., Dwyer, C., Vasquez, M., ... & Turner, S. (2010). *Diasporas: Concepts, intersections, identities*. Bloomsbury Publishing.
- Holton, R. J. (2017). *Cosmopolitanisms: New thinking and new directions*. Bloomsbury Publishing.
- Crabtree, S. A., & Wong, H. (2013). 'Ah Cha'! The racial discrimination of Pakistani minority communities in Hong Kong: an analysis of multiple, intersecting oppressions. *British Journal of Social Work*, 43(5), 945-963.
- Cornwall, A., & Molyneux, M. (2006). The politics of rights—Dilemmas for feminist praxis: An introduction. *Third World Quarterly*, 27(7), 1175-1191.
- Phillips, C., & Webster, C. (Eds.). (2014). *New directions in race, ethnicity and crime*. London: Routledge.
- Duschinski, H., Bhan, M., & Robinson, C. D. (2020). New Directions in Kashmir Studies: Unsettling State Power, Military Violence, and Border Regimes Across Kashmir. In *The Palgrave Handbook of New Directions in Kashmir Studies* (pp. 1-21). Cham: Springer International Publishing.
- Collins, P. H., & Bilge, S. (2020). *Intersectionality*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Fresnoza-Flot, A., & De Hart, B. (2020). Divorce in transnational families: Norms, networks, and intersecting categories. *Population, Space and Place*, 28(5), e2582.
- Jaffrelot, C. (Ed.). (2016). *Pakistan at the crossroads: Domestic dynamics and external pressures*. Columbia University Press.
- Dasanayaka, S. W. (2008). SMEs in globalized world: A brief note on basic profiles of Pakistan's small and medium scale enterprises and possible research directions. *Business Review*, 3(1), 69-78.
- Bano, S. (2007). Muslim family justice and human rights: The experience of British Muslim women. *J. Comp. L.*, 2, 38.
- Levitt, P., & Jaworsky, B. N. (2007). Transnational migration studies: Past developments and future trends. *Annu. Rev. Sociol.*, 33, 129-156.
- McGhee, D. (2008). *EBOOK: The End of Multiculturalism? Terrorism, Integration and Human Rights*. McGraw-Hill Education (UK).
- Imran, R. (2016). *Activist documentary film in Pakistan: The emergence of a cinema of accountability*. Routledge.
- Robertson, M. (2017). Queering scholarship on Christianity and queer sexuality: Reviewing nuances and new directions. *African Journal of Gender and Religion*, 23(2).
- Robertson, M. (2017). Queering scholarship on Christianity and queer sexuality: Reviewing nuances and new directions. *African Journal of Gender and Religion*, 23(2).
- Robertson, M. (2017). Queering scholarship on Christianity and queer sexuality: Reviewing nuances and new directions. *African Journal of Gender and Religion*, 23(2).



- Manchanda, R. (2020). Difficult encounters with the WPS agenda in South Asia: re-scripting globalized norms and policy frameworks for a feminist peace. In *New Directions in Women, Peace and Security* (pp. 61-82). Bristol University Press.
- Manchanda, R. (2020). Difficult encounters with the WPS agenda in South Asia: re-scripting globalized norms and policy frameworks for a feminist peace. In *New Directions in Women, Peace and Security* (pp. 61-82). Bristol University Press.