



AN EVALUATION OF POLICE REFORMS IN PUNJAB

Mr. SALAM DASTGIR

MPhil Research Scholar University of Okara

Email: salamdastgir19@gmail.com

Mr. MUHAMMAD QASIR NAWAZ

MPhil Research Scholar University of Okara

Email: qasirnawazbhatti@gmail.com

MR. HAFIZ MUHAMMAD AHMAD

MPhil Scholar, Department of Sociology, University of Okara

Email: muhammadahmadwattoo2525@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study is to examine the given police reforms in the province of Punjab, Pakistan which are being tailored by the Inspector General of Punjab police Dr. Usman Anwar. Several problems have been experienced in this regard including but not limited to inefficiency, corruption and political interference particularly from the province of Punjab, which is the most populated province in Pakistan. Dr. Anwar's period brought about changes that focused positively on areas such as performance, restore the image and the confidence of the public in the Punjab Police. Since the research assesses the effects of these reforms it uses both qualitative and quantitative data in the study. Some of the important focus areas covered are the impact of media on public, role of forensic in police work and issues of gender-mainly men-into police force. The study shows that these reforms have been both successful and problematic, thus giving practical direction as to how such reforms will be effective in the future. The findings of this study should be useful to policymakers, law enforcement agencies, as well as the academic community in understanding the nature and dynamics of police reform and the challenges related to it, so as to enhance discourse on governance, human rights and socio-economic stability.

The Imperative of police reforms in Punjab: evaluating change under leadership

In the color-blended but heterogeneous topography of the Punjab province of Pakistan where the demand of good police reforms was always unheard of more than ever before. As the most populous province and as the Kenya' melting pot 'with all tribes affiliated to it, the province occupies the center of old-style and new-age leadership (Muschik, 2022). Note: Straightly related, stability and prosperity well spring up based on how well the area's police work, more so considering they are not only guardians of the law and the order but also stewards of the areas' trust vested in them. However, the diabolical cases of inefficiency, allegations of corruption and proper governance have surprisingly led to a revision and reorganization of the Punjab Police with a view to enable the police to render improved services to the citizens. IGP Dr Usman Anwar's period concerns a unique era in the campaign for reforming police departments, a process ongoing currently (Ahsan, 2020). His leadership is an explanation of the case study which in fact as a methodology of presenting and making meaning of the changes that took place in the Punjab Police. He oversaw a program involving full-scale changes that were in line with a new policy regime to address issues of institutional sclerosis, institutional reform, and promotion of public confidence and participation from the community. These changes in the present case and sustaining or scaling up of the changes is an area that I must address to in the development of my thesis exposition.

The study will investigate the police reforms that have been carried out in Punjab with especial reference to the period before and after the research finding of Dr. Anwar. This would be established with the use of both qualitative and quantitative techniques of data collection and in this decent, it is sought to provide an account of the character of reforms, review their efficiency and synthesize the impact of the reforms on the law enforcement system in Punjab. That is why the thesis is designed to compare the position of the police before Dr. Anwar's participation and during it. Thus, it is a summarizing description of all the reforms made and the conditions affecting their

implementation, and condition positively and negatively (Akhtar & Gillani, 2024). It is after painting an historical background and the modern face of policing crises in Punjab that the thesis takes on literature review based on the international reforms and inside Pakistan. The following parts of this work will be related to the particular reforms initiated by Dr Anwar and then to the result of this reform will be measured by using qualitative- quantitative measure at last comparative analysis will be provided to measure the extent of change. The main and most general purpose is to provide policymakers, law enforcement agencies, and the academic community with the knowledge about dynamics of police reforms and the role of accurate and competent leadership in this process (Oluwaniyi, 2021).

The evolution of policing in Punjab: a historical overview

Like the other areas of India, the policing structure in Punjab also resembles much from its colonial biography. In this respect, setting its root firmly in the British colonial framework, the Punjab Police was established in 1861 as the 'implementing agent' under the Indian Police Act. This force was formed first of all to maintain the status quo and for the benefit of the colonial masters and not the indigenous population. Its aim was to maintain the status quo and to cater for the needs of the colonial masters and not that of the people of the colonies. Due to colonial influences, the sovereignty has in recent years influenced the policing structure and the manner in which force of the state is applied while the police is perceived as a force intending to dominate the society instead of serving the community. The prehistoric setting paints out the internal problems that police encounter to transform from authoritarianism to democracy model whereby the individuals in law enforcement begin to transform their old characteristics as they embrace new principles such as transparency, accountability and public services in their new facilities (Akramov & Qureshi, 2023).

Challenges plaguing the Punjab Police

Punjab Police have experienced a number of challenges and problems in recent times including a variety of problems that are structural and systemic in nature. These drawbacks more or less considerably weaken the position of the police force and restrict its possibility to ensure sufficient law enforcement and security essentials. Press freedom, despite being relatively liberal compared to the rest of Africa, is similarly restricted to a considerable degree: one of the most persistent vices is corruption. Such malpractices carried out by the police officers are a thorn in the force's reputation and citizens' trust. This is especially a problem for female officials in the policing. "Everyone talks of corruption and therefore, women leaders do not get the respect and support they require in order to serve. It also erodes the reputation of every officer within the institution and also the public's trust in the police. Lack of proper training is another enormous problem for the Punjab Police. Some of the officers have no adequate ability, experience, and information required in exercising their responsibilities. It is clear, that most of training programs are in their majority ineffective and do not correspond to the needs of the modern law enforcements. The lack of training means that the officers entering service are not equipped to deal with various policing issues, cope with multiple tasks, including handling of multiple types of crimes, comprehending and implementing various technologies in policing, and interact with the people. A low level of participation and political bias are some of the other issues that worsen a situation within the Punjab Police. Another key problem that may be mentioned is connected with political influence in the work of the police force, which also intertwines its operational independence. Most of the police practices are dictated by political influence and this leads to unfair polices and selection of officers. They had criticized this political bias as prejudicial to the rule of law and as a factor that could alienate the public from the police. Further, limited police representation where the force's minorities and women are underrepresented in the community makes up the force's population. This factor leads to biased policing and a social discord between the police and the community due to poor diverse relations.

These challenges utilize notwithstanding the fact that Punjab Police does not have Professional Development training and development forum. Police officers receive minimal professional development training, which is crucial in creating awareness with the ever changing task of police officers. This lack of professional development results in a stoppage of growth and knowledge thus leading to police officers not being able to employ new and efficient ways of policing. There are several social issues in today's society that is hard coded to be solved using traditional methods of policing unfortunately most officers are not trained and guided hence they resort to using outdated techniques. The rules and regulations of the bureaucracy and government are the second challenge that affects the Punjab Police in its working. In most cases, the bureaucratic structure is described by slow advancement, the prevalence of rules and formalities. This bureaucracy hampers timely response to emerging challenges and hence slow down action. The bureaucracy and the tradition that goes with it can hurt decision-making, developing policies and procedures that may not be beneficial to effective policing. This slow and slow-moving, often inefficient bureaucracy only serves to widen the distance between police and the population, and diminish the latter's trust in the police. The culmination of all these challenges brings a lot of dysfunctionality in the working of the Punjab Police. These include corruption which hampers effective policing, poor training, political bias which hinders the free flowed relationship between the police and the citizens and bureaucratic nature of work. This leads to policing not being in tune with the requirements of contemporary society and being highly 'policing-focused'. Due to the social indifference in the policed community, the cooperation of the citizens is negligible, which is a necessity in policing. As propounded earlier, the police force cannot adequately enforce law and order, let alone protect and serve the public, if they are not supported by the community and trusted by the same.

Methods and Materials

3.1. Research design

This chapter presents an account on the research design that has been adopted in this study. The research design is a map of the study showing how the whole exercise was conducted. It covers the approaches that were employed in the collection of data as well as the ways in which the data was analyzed. A good research design enables the study to be systematic, reliable and valid in addition to helping in the elimination or reduction of prejudicial influences on the study.

This research is a mixed research study. This means that it actually incorporates both, quantitative and qualitative research techniques. The use of both methods therefore gives a comprehensive analysis of the police reforms in Punjab.

Data sources

This sub-section aims at explaining the type of data utilized in this research. To gather information about the police reforms in Punjab primary as well as secondary sources of data were used. The main type of data is appreciable through interviews, focus group, and questionnaire. The secondary source comprises of police reports, documents from the courts, and the media communication (Aamer, 2020).

Interviews

Police officials as well as ordinary citizens and policy makers were interviewed. These interviews made the surveys more colorful and elicited factual experiences and perceptions of those that directly entailed in or affected by these police reforms (Aftab, Sarwar, Kiran, Abid, & Ahmad, 2022).

Police officials: Expressed their opinions concerning the reforms both as concerns their functioning in the enterprise and their consequences. Some of the things that the participants of the study were

asked to share included; alteration to procedures observed, difficulties encountered, and perceived advantages of the reform.

Community members: Gave an understanding of how the reforms impacted the parties when engaging with the police. They discussed their impressions of police actions and outcomes as well as perceptions of police work and police credibility.

Policymakers: Explored the intended and planned targets for the reforms, ways of implementing the reforms together with the anticipated results. Others helped to contextualize the decisions made and the goals which were expected to be achieved with such changes (Ahmad et al., 2021).

Data analysis

This section provides information about the data collected for the study and the process of analyzing the data. Data collected for the study was analyzed qualitatively and quantitatively so as to gain an in-depth prognosis of police reforms in Punjab (Anwar et al., 2023). The process for analyzing each form of data is described more fully below.

RESULTS AND ANALYSIS

Thematic analysis

Thematic analysis is a way of categorizing, comprehending and making sense out of patterns of data. It entails categorizing the data so as to identify pattern in the information acquired. This method is use in helping to classify then accurately describe the data. It's helpful in the analysis of large quantities of qualitative data.

Several key themes emerged from the analysis:

- Leadership and vision
- Operational changes
- Community involvement

These themes were arrived at after a close look at the interview and focus group data. Both of them reflect a major area of the police reforms.

Leadership and vision

The leadership style being charismatic, visionary and transformational especially in the direction of police reforms there has been recognition of Dr. Usman Anwar as the worthy leader. During his stewardship, Dr. Anwar has been keen in ensuring that many reforms were carried in the police force, especially in issues of transparency, accountability, and community relations (Fernandez & Rainey, 2021). Dr. Usman Anwar is known to be a strategic planner of great repute that provides his vision for the future revolving around the goal formulation and the encouragement of all the relevant stakeholders to propel towards the achievement of the said goals. The role he has played in such leadership has been central to the contemporary structural reform of the police, increasing of accountability mechanisms, and improving the relations between police and the community. People of different surveys also underscore his contribution to bringing about huge positive changes in the police force as a result of clear visions and tenacity in communication (Fernandez & Rainey, 2021). One of the most important principles that Dr. Anwar acknowledged as the leader of the company is the policy of openness and responsibility. These principles he made the priorities so that he could restore the trust within the police force and gain the credibility of the public. This approach entails the provision of open access to information especially in policy making processes, dissemination of organizational mission and vision and taking responsibility for the actions of organizational officers. Such practices do not only support the highest standards of performance within an organization, but also help create and sustain ethical behaviors as well as proper compliance particularly in law enforcement organizations (Khan , Hamid, Khan, Sarfraz, & Babar , 2023).

Building trust and ownership

In the case of Dr. Anwar leadership feature observed is the capacity to promote accountability and feelings of ownership among the officers. By explicating personnel on his reform

initiatives and fostering their involvement in decision making, many a time, he has ensured that they become more proactive, in supporting the accomplishment organizational goals. Such involvement encourages organisational culture whereby officers have the feeling and commitment to support reform agendas. Police reforms that have happened since the appointment of Dr. Anwar as a head of the force have seen changes in the cultural of the organization that embraces proactive police authority as well as community oriented. This change may be observed in policy amendments, better practices, and innovative technologies that can help improve the performance and sensitivity of federal agencies. In reforming the Police practice to meet current norm and expectation, Dr Anwar has built organizational capability and coping mechanisms when facing various difficulty within the police force. Dr. Anwar has been instrumental in the formulation of some major Greenfield policies designed at increasing effectiveness of operations and security amongst others. This include; the changes in use of force mechanisms, enhancement of crime fighting techniques and even use of hi-tech equipment in police work. Technology advancements like data analytics and digital platforms for instance have been applied by Dr. Anwar's police force to review its capacities regarding new security risks and upgrade its provision of services. He also explains that communication and relational management of stakeholders can be a critical success factors for the leadership. He uses public forums such as town meetings, community organizations and community-government partnership forums and other community-government collaborative programs, to seek views and opinions in addressing community issues. The proactive engagement approach used guarantees that the police reforms strategic plans are in touch with the local demands and are sensitive to the people's conditions and wants, thus encouraging the populace to have confidence in the police. Some of the leadership competencies that stand out and have been quite useful in confronting issues and emergencies in the course of reformation police force include Addictiveness. His capacity to act promptly in the unpredictable situations, meaningful communication, and being responsible has helped preserve people's trust and organizational stability during crises (Javed, 2019).

There is evidence that supports Dr. Anwar's proven organizational practices of enhancing organizational performance and social responsibility. Evaluating his reform programs, they found that crime level has been decreased, response time has been improved as well as public satisfaction to police services was increased (Kanwal, Zahid, & Afzal, 2023) .

Operational changes

Out of the extensive reforms embarked on across the United States to enhance the efficiencies of the police forces, operational changes comprised a significant proportion of the measures that were implemented for the purpose of modernizing the use of innovations and tools in policing. At the heart of these reforms was the incorporation of the modern technologies, the enhancements of the scientific crime scene investigation as well as the training that came with it. These reforms collectively attempted processes rationalization, better investigative efficiency, and a more community policed, ethically guided police force (Khan, Salamzadeh, & Rethi, 2020).

Integration of modern technologies

Certainly, one of the most significant processes in the sphere of police reform was the implementation of advanced technologies. The major innovation areas included in the said policy included introduction of digital First Information Report (FIR) registration systems. This technology upgrade was intended to enhance the mechanized registration of complaints and starting of criminal investigations. Khattak and Asghar in their study suggest that there is a possibility of improving the efficiency in the FIR process by making it a digital process and mobile, and could in the process save the effort of a lot of paperwork which is time consuming and delay access to such crucial information that are necessary to support immediate action and decision making (P2).

Admission of forensic science in investigations

Another of the major focal areas of the operational reforms was the application in criminal investigations of forensic science. Development in both the technology and the methods used in

forensic most certainly improved the efficiency, credibility and scientific nature of the findings and resolution of crimes. This integration has shifted policing strategies from crime fight models towards effectiveness evidenced models designed at enhancing the judicial results and increasing the community's confidence in the police (Komal, Janjua, Anwar, & Madni, 2019).

Enhancing evidence accuracy and reliability

The come-on of some disciplines of forensic science like DNA fingerprinting, fingerprint identification, and ballistics increases the efficiency of the law enforcement agencies. The new techniques helped detectives to collect and interpret the tangible evidence scientifically and more objectively. With the help of the latest technologies available in the fields of forensic, police officers could justify witness statements, visually recognize culprits, and guarantee the connection between criminals and scenes of crimes. Not only did the improvement in forensic evidence increase the rate of speedy and conclusive solutions for criminal cases but it was able to properly charge the offenders through proper legal procedures (Kondra & Hurst, 2019).

Community trust and engagement

Efforts to restore the public confidence and encourage them to report cases have been seen through a number of measures that all seek to bring the police closer to members of the public. Of all the measures, probably one of the most striking and efficient has been the holding of meetings on the town's matters. These meetings afford members of the community an opportunity to air their views, make complaints, ask questions or make suggestions to the police. It provides equal and mutual exchange of information that makes the public to have a feeling that they are part of the process, and that their opinions are being considered. This also helps the police officers further in their understanding of the society's needs and demands in a bid to provide an effective and efficient police service. Another big concept of community policing is the different activities that is done so as to restore the trust of the community and cooperation. These are intended to facilitate interaction and improve relations between the cops on the one hand and the societies on the other so as to foster the police involvement in the societies as friendly faces. Officers should be able to work on community projects, collaborate with community members in such projects and can easily be accessed by the community members. This not only serves to de-emphasize the 'cop' aspect of the policing (which is important when trying to earn the trust of a community, or when developing humane policies for dealing other humans), but also aids in giving the officers a perspective of the peculiarities of different cultures/prescriptions of different communities. Therefore, the police can suit the approach of the policing strategy more effectively to the needs of the community, thus efficient and sensitive policing takes place. Transparency of communication has also been another key area in the creation of trust during these attempts. Informing the public on the activities of the police as well as the reformation processes ongoing in the police force makes the general public to understand the functions of the police force and make little or no room for misunderstanding. Using the social media platforms, newsletters, and press releases, the public is informed of the ongoing activities, new policies and the results of police investigations. Sustaining such transparency is important in establishing the much-needed trust because it shows that there is willingness in being answerable to the widely held values and norms (Miranda, 2022).

Financial grants

In IG Dr. Usman Anwar's term different grants worth about PKR 10 billion were provided to the Punjab Police for their operational, welfare, and physical needs. Such grants were useful in various ways, a fact that can be evidenced by the following examples. For operational improvements, about a half of the funds was spent for purchasing vehicles, communication and surveillance equipment that would cost about PKR 3 billion. This investment was targeted to enhance the capability of the police force in terms of effectiveness and time showing on the offenders. Also, PKR 500 million was provided for the training of the police force in relation to advanced policing models, cybercrime prevention, and forensic examination (Abbas et al., 2020).

Amounting to about PKR 2 billion in welfare and incentives were provided for the purpose of enhancing the availability and quality of housing accommodation and health care facilities for the police force. This involved the development of new or residential developments and the modernization of current ones, new medical facilities and joint ventures with medical facilities. PKR 300 million were provided for education and scholarships of children of police personnel that aim to provide quality education and police supportive environment to families.

Medical grants

For the medical and health care facilities of the police personals and their families, there were notable strides during the period of Dr. Usman Anwar as IG Punjab Police. These initiatives were part of a larger goal to improve the quality of life of the force and provide for their needs because of the rigor of the work they do (Eck & Rossmo, 2019).

Several new health care facilities were opened across Punjab for police personal and their dependents. These centers were furnished with sophisticated medical facilities and manned with qualified medical practitioners with an objective of reaching out to the extent of rendering quality and affordable medical facility in close vicinity of police residential colonies and places of work. Furthermore, there was also firmly expansion of strength and supports of police medical facilities; upgrading existing police medical facilities such as renovation of ageing infrastructure, procurement of new medical technologies, and extension of services. They made certain that polices personnel effectively received modern treatments and diagnostic machinery as a means of enhancing the general healthcare of the personnel.

Marriage grants

When Dr. Usman Anwar served his term as IG Punjab Police many efforts were made to extend financial help to meet the needs especially marriage expenses of the police personnel and their dependents. These grants were intended to cater for the costs incurred in Weddings to enable police officers start their children's married life in some dignity. This was open to all serving and retired police personnel, and gave preference to the recipients in the lower income brackets, with the grants ranging from PKR 50,000 to PKR 200,000 on the basis of the applicants rank and income respectively (Ali & Hashmi, 2022). The application for the loans was very easy, the requirements included proof of service, income and marriage certificates. Those who were in acute financial difficulties or had many daughters to marry off were given additional privileges and this was evidence of a humane approach to people's needs. The release of funds was made as soon as possible, which became helpful in raising morale and living standards of the police, especially junior ranks, who can have greater fiscal difficulties. Recipients thanked for assistance citing that the application was not lengthy and got cash within a short time. Because of these concerns, such grants enabled officers to clear most of their financial burdens, thus resulting in dedication and commitment among the force. The long-term indispensables entailed promotion of job contentment and commitment that supposed improved performance and service provision. This she said was an indication of the kind of caring personality that Dr. Usman Anwar had shown towards the better welfare of the police personnel and their families because as the doctor rightly observed personal and family issues were an important fact that contributed to the efficient and effective functioning of a policing system (Farooq, 2022).

Family claim grants

While Dr. Usman Anwar was the Inspector General (IG) of Punjab Police, several steps were taken for the betterment of the Police personnel and their dependents by introduction and up gradation of family claims. These claims were intended to cater emergencies which may include the death of an officer, medical complications and any other hardship thus improving the financial status of the police families (Iqbal, Saleem, Baig, & Zuntiqaam-Ul-Hassan, 2023). Family claims were introduced so that as to provide some monetary support to the family of both working police professionals as well as retirees. The process followed was efficient and very much straightforward and it involved

producing some vital documents in order to enhance the consideration of the claims such as; proof of service, death certificates, and medical report among others. It helped that needful families were able to be reached out to as required in a rather streamlined manner.

Housing scheme grants

During the service of Dr. Usman Anwar as IG Punjab Police, adequate focus was laid on provoking the housing amenities of the police officer through the provision of the housing grant policy. Such grants were intended for improving the quality of living in housing, and to help to lessen costs of acquiring a home. Key aspects of the housing grants during this period include:

The housing grants were developed to enable the police personnel to be supported financially to enable them acquire houses or build houses. Admittedly realizing that housing is a necessity that saves the life of the officers and their families, the grants targeted to help them afford decent places (Mehboob, 2022). The scheme was aimed at both on-duty and off-duty police employees, with emphasis being made on the junior and less privileged employees. There were precise objectives in qualifying a person for the housing grants; these included the rank of the officer, years of service, and the state of the available housing. The proposed procedure of application was to be simplified, the necessary documents included proof of service, income statements and other documents referring to property, which were intended to ease the grant approval process. This approach was helpful to avoid numerous bureaucratic obstacles which might delay the deserving candidates to get the support they needed (Maqsood et al., 2019). This dependency related to an applicant's rank as well as the type of housing sought; the Carpenters' Society Detail was different for different levels of housing grant. In most cases grant size that was awarded was between PKR 300000 and PKR 1500000. These could be for instance used in a purchase of new apartments or homes, for construction of homes on tracts of land or for major renovations of existing homes. The freedom in the application of the funds enabled the police personnel meet their particular housing requirements satisfactorily.

Conclusion

In conclusion, the findings emphasize the need to reconceptualize policing as a dynamic, reciprocal process involving significant reform. Key areas such as community policing, training and development, accountability, resource allocation, and partnerships are essential for improving the efficiency and credibility of police forces. Community policing, with its focus on proactive problem-solving and building face-to-face interactions, fosters cooperation between police and communities by addressing issues collaboratively and preventing conflict escalation. This approach helps dismantle mutual negative perceptions, enhancing public trust and support. Ultimately, such strategies contribute to creating a just, engaged, and effective police force that integrates seamlessly with the community it serves, strengthening the overall fabric of society.

References

- Aamer, T. (2020). Bureaucracy and clientelism in an authoritarian context: a case study of local government reforms (2001-2009) in Pakistan. *University of Southampton Institutional Research Repository*, 622(1), 237-248.
- Abbas, Z., Akram, M. B., & Saud, M. (2020). Police conduct toward complainants of crime: Cross-sectional study of Punjab Police. *Punjab Police Reforms*, 33(2), 146-152.
- Abid, & Qaiser. (2019). Police Reforms in Pakistan: An Analysis of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Model. *Journal of Political Studies*, 26(2), 235-254.
- Adams, I., & Mastracci, S. (2021). Visibility is a Trap: The Ethics of Police Body-Worn Cameras and Control. *Administrative Theory & Praxis*, 39(4), 313-328.
- Aftab, J., Sarwar, H., Kiran, A., Abid, N., & Ahmad, S. B. (2022). Do transformational leadership and work engagement matter for job performance in luxury hotels? Exploring the role of leaders' managerial skills. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Insights*, 6(5), 1818-1839.
- Ahmad, T., Thaheem, M. J., & Anwar, A. (2021). Developing a green-building design approach by selective use of systems and techniques. *Architectural Engineering and Design Management*, 12(1), 29-50.
- Ahsan, S. A. (2020). Police Reforms: Public Perception and Introspection. *Pakistan Journal of Criminology*, 9(3), 155-162.
- Akramov, K. T., & Qureshi, S. (2023). Decentralization, Local Government Elections and Voter. *Washington DC, IFPRI*, 255(6), 655-661.
- Arble, E., & Arnetz, B. B. (2019). Four Fundamental Principles to Enhance Police Performance and Community Safety. *Interventions, Training, and Technologies for Improved Police Well-Being and Performance*, 321(2), 342-354.
- Ashworth, A., & Zedner, L. (2021). Defending the Criminal Law: Reflections on the Changing Character of Crime, Procedure, and Sanctions. *Criminal Law and Philosophy*, 2(1), 21-51.

- Aslam, G., & Yilmaz, S. (2020). Impact of decentralization reforms in Pakistan on service delivery-An empirical study. *Public Administration and Development*, 31(3), 159-171.
- Austin, A. (2021). Defunding the Police: True Police Reform or Just Political Smoke and Mirrors? A Look at the City of Camden, New Jersey and Its Approach to Police Reform. *The Asian Journal of Studies*, 138(9), 221-227.
- Azfar, O. (2021). Decentralisation experience in Pakistan. *A Comparative Perspective*. P. K. Bardhan and D, 193(8), 143-151.
- Aziz, A., Israr, A., Dahri, D. A., Anwar, A., & Asif, M. U. (2021). The impact of strategic process, information sharing service obtained and service expectation on supply chain performance in freight forwarding industry of Pakistan. *Ilkogretim Online - Elementary Education Online*, 20(5), 7114-7129.
- Bank, W. (2023). World Development Report. *Washington DC, World Bank*, 182(3), 162-168.
- Bardhan, P., & Mookerjee, D. (2020). Decentralization and Accountability in Infrastructure Delivery in Developing Countries. *Boston, Boston University*: 43, 129(8), 192-197.
- Basharat, H., & T., F. (2020). Citizen-Centric Policing: Citizens' Expectations of Police in Punjab. *The Asian Journal of Studies*, 224(10), 187-195.
- Bell, S. (2019). An Introduction to Scientific and Investigative Techniques. *Forensic Science*, 125(2), 121-335.
- Bharosa, N., Lee, J., & Janssen, M. (2019). Challenges and obstacles in sharing and coordinating information during multi-agency disaster response: Propositions from field exercises. *Information Systems Frontiers*, 12(2), 49-65.
- Bhutta, M. K., Rana, A. I., & Asad, U. (2020). Owner characteristics and health of SMEs in Pakistan. *Journal of Small Business and Enterprise Development*, 15(1), 130-149.
- Bibi, S., Maryam, A., & Mustafa, A. (2023). The Police Culture in Pakistan; An Ethical Evaluation. *Review of Education, Administration and Law*, 6(2), 579-592.
- Bilimoria, D., Joy, S., & Liang, X. (2019). Breaking barriers and creating inclusiveness: Lessons of organizational transformation to advance women faculty in academic science and engineering. *Human Resource Managements*, 47(3), 423-441.
- Blair, G., Weinstein, J. M., & Arias, E. (2021). Community policing does not build citizen trust in police or reduce crime in the Global South. *Community Poling does not Build Citizen Trust in Police or Reduce Crime in the Global L South*, 374(3), 332-365.
- Farooq, H. (2022). Local Government System in low income communities in Northern Punjab: A study to analyze the perceptions of People, Politicians and Bureaucrats. *Punjab Police Reforms*, 136(9), 192-223.
- Fernandez, S., & Rainey, H. G. (2021). Managing Successful Organizational Change in the Public Sector. *Debating Public Administration*, 322(5), 234-265.
- Gill, N. K., & Navreet. (2020). Governance Reform Initiatives in Punjab: a Review. *Journal of Governance and Public Policy*, 10(2), 2-17.
- Ham, M. (2020). The role of subjective norms in forming the intention to purchase green food. *Economic research - Ekonomska istraživanja*, 28(1), 21-27.
- Hamid, S., Ijab, M. T., Sulaiman, H., Anwar, R. M., & Norman, A. A. (2017). Social media for environmental sustainability awareness in higher education. *International Journal of Sustainability in Higher Education*, 18(4), 474-491.
- Hashmi, Z. A. (2022). Governing Strategies in Re-Imaging Punjab Police: An Assessment. *The Asian Journal of Studies*, 635(8), 622-636.
- Hassan, & Sumeera. (2020). Human rights dimensions and madrasa education: an overlooked perspective : the case of Pakistan. *Global Campus Europe: EMA*, 135(3), 232-245.
- Iqbal, M. Z., Shakoor, A., Ikramullah, M., & Khan, T. (2023). Do managers' negotiation styles make employees' relational justice-emotional experiences links sporadic? *International Journal of Conflict Management*, 34(3), 440-467.
- Islam, A., Wahab, S. A., & Abdul Latiff, A. S. (2022). Annexing a Smart Sustainable Business Growth Model for Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs). *World Journal of Entrepreneurship Management and Sustainable Development*, 18(2), 185-201.
- Jackson, J., Asif, M., Bradford, B., & Zakar, M. Z. (2020). Corruption and Police Legitimacy in Lahore, Pakistan. *The British Journal of Criminology*, 54(6), 1067-1088.
- Jamal, M. T., Anwar, I., Khan, N. A., & Saleem, I. (2021). Work during COVID-19: assessing the influence of job demands and resources on practical and psychological outcomes for employees. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Business Administration*, 13(3), 293-319.
- Janjua, A., Attique, F., Raza, A., & Akbar, W. (2019). Effective performance management of local governments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan. *International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management*, 68(1), 26-45.
- Jatoi, S. K., Leghari, D. A., & Tahir, D. M. (2023). Analysis of Defected Investigation and it Effect on Trial in Pakistan: Causes and Solutions. *Human Nature Journal of Social Sciences*, 4(1), 132-165.
- Javed, U. (2019). Profit in the Name of Islam: The Bazaar-Mosque Relationship in Punjab, Pakistan. *Securing Peace and Prosperity*, 543(7), 191-214.
- Kanwal, A., Zahid, A., & Afzal, A. (2023). Investigating the Benefits and Challenges of Blended Learning Approaches at the University Level. *Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 4(3), 76-89.
- Kaplan, R. S. (2021). The role for empirical research in management accounting. *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, 11(4-5), 429-452.
- Khan, M. A., Hamid, S., Khan, S. A., Sarfraz, M., & Babar, Z. U.-D. (2023). A Qualitative Study of Stakeholders' Views on Pharmacovigilance System, Policy, and Coordination in Pakistan. *Drugs Outcomes Research and Policies*, 542(1), 145-176.
- Khan, R. U., Idrees, D. R., & Shahid, A. (2024). Pakistan's Climate Change Act: Evaluating Impacts, Efficacy, and Prospects for Future Progress. *International Research Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities (IRJSSH)*, 3(1), 332-348.
- Khattak, T., & Asghar, D. R. (2024). Strategic Counter Measures to Terrorism and Extremism in Pakistan and Insights from Home Land Security. *Inverge Journal of Social Sciences*, 3(1), 132-145.
- Komal, B., Janjua, U. I., Anwar, F., & Madni, T. M. (2019). The Impact of Scope Creep on Project Success: An Empirical Investigation. *IEEE Access*, 8(1), 234-243.
- Kondra, A. M., & Hurst, D. C. (2019). Institutional processes of organizational culture. *Culture and Organization*, 15(1), 39-58.
- Laila, U., Sadiq, N., Mehmood, T., & Fiaz, M. F. (2020). E-Governance as a Roadmap to Good Governance: A Digital Punjab Perspective. *Journal of Accounting and Finance in Emerging Economies*, 6(3).
- Li, L., Aslam, S., Wileman, A., & Perinpanayagam, S. (2020). Digital Twin in Aerospace Industry: A Gentle Introduction. *Punjab Police Reforms*, 10(1), 9543-9562.
- Maqsood, T., Madani, S. A., Nawab, B., Ullah, S., & Nyborg, I. (2019). Role of ICT in Community-Oriented Policing in South Asia: Challenges and Opportunities. *Journal of Human Security*, 15(2), 132-149.
- Mason, D., Hillenbrand, C., & Money, K. (2021). Are Informed Citizens More Trusting? Transparency of Performance Data and Trust Towards a British Police Force. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 122(11), 321-341.
- Mehboob, S. H. (2022). Political Parties and Devolution of Power in Punjab after the 18th Amendment. *The Asian Journal of Studies*, 162(10), 162-187.

- Mehmood, A. (2019). ICTs, Urban Security and Police Culture in Punjab (Pakistan): Some questions on Organizational Values. *Punjab Police Reforms*, 543(1), 35-109.
- Miranda, D. (2022). Body-worn cameras 'on the move': exploring the contextual, technical and ethical challenges in policing practice. *Policing and society*, 192(12), 18-34.
- Muhammad Shahid, T. A. (2021). Technological Dramas and the Punjab Police: The Downfall of Front Desk. *The Asian Journal of Studies*, 132(11), 121-129.
- Muhammad Umair Ali, A. K. (2022). Police Reforms in Punjab for Effective Counter Terrorism: A Preliminary Assessment. *The Asian Journal of Studies*, 634(12), 122-135.
- Muhammad, S. (2020). Improving Efficiency of the Court Service in Pakistan : A Comparative Study of the Options for Reform. *Newcastle University*, 232(2), 645-687.
- Munir, M., Ali, S. R., Muhammad, N., Shah, M., Abdullah, & Imran. (2020). The appointment of Dr. Usman Anwar as IGP marked a critical juncture in these ongoing efforts. Charged with the task of implementing comprehensive reforms, his tenure was seen as a pivotal opportunity to translate the growing consensus for change into tan. *Pakistan Journal of Criminology*, 4(1), 125-141.
- Muschik, E.-M. (2022). The Art of Chameleon Politics: From Colonial Servant to International Development Expert. *The Art of Chameleon Politics: From Colonial Servant to International Development Expert*, 9(2), 219-244.
- Nausheen, M., & Shakeel. (2023). Unmasking Illegitimate Tasks in Banking: A Qualitative Exploration of Types, Contributing Factors, Impact, and Potential Mitigating Strategies in the Pakistani Context. *International Journal of Trend in Scientific Research and Development*, 7(6), 303-327.
- Nikmanesh, M., Feili, A., & Sorooshian, S. (2023). Employee Productivity Assessment Using Fuzzy Inference System. 14(7).
- Nisar, M. A. (2024). Overcoming resistance to resistance in public administration: Resistance strategies of marginalized publics in citizen-state interactions. *Public Administration and Development*, 38(1), 15-25.
- Nisar, S. K., Rasheed, M. I., & Qiang, W. (2018). They can't safeguard you when they are under stress: An exploratory study on issues and problems of job stress in police. *International Journal of Police Science & Management*, 20(2), 622-336.
- Noor, A. (2023). User satisfaction and User behavior of e-Governance services in Pakistan: Does youth drive acceptance of technology? *Technology Governance and Digital Transformation*, 336(1), 622-714.
- Nwagwu, U., Niaz, M., Chukwu, M. U., & Saddique, F. (2023). The influence of artificial intelligence to enhancing supply chain performance under the mediating significance of supply chain collaboration in manufacturing and logistics organizations in Pakistan. *Traditional Journal of Multidisciplinary Sciences*, 1(2), 656-567.
- Nyborg, L.P., I., Nawab, & Bahadar. (2020). Civil Security in the Wake of Crisis - Renegotiating Police-Community Relations in Post-Crisis Development in Swat, Pakistan. *Journal of Human Security*, 16(2), 134-148.
- Nzabonimpa, J. P. (2018). Quantitizing and qualitizing (im-)possibilities in mixed methods research. *Methodological Innovations*, 11(2), 161-179.
- Oluwaniyi, O. (2021). Police and the institution of corruption in Nigeria. *Policing and Society*, 21(1), 67-83.
- Parks, S., Hoffman, M., Goudar, S., Patel, A., Saleem, S., Ali, S., . . . Derman, R. (2019). Maternal anaemia and maternal, fetal, and neonatal outcomes in a prospective cohort study in India and Pakistan. *An International Journal of Obstetrics & Gynaecology*, 126(6), 737-743.
- Parveen, D. T., shah, D. A., & Qazi, B. D. (2023). Sustainable Environmental Development Goals: A Comparative Analysis of India and Pakistan. *Shnakhat*, 2(4), 80-111.
- Rahman, T. (2021). Pakistan Wars An Alternative History. *Punjab Police Reforms*, 342(4), 432-476.
- Rani, U., & Furrer, M. (2020). Digital labour platforms and new forms of flexible work in developing countries: Algorithmic management of work and workers. *Competition & Change*, 25(2), 347-370.
- Rashid, A., Jan, I., & Ahmed, M. (2021). Pakistani Police Governance and Accountability: Challenges and Recommendations. *Journal of South Asian Studies*, 9(3), 21-35.
- Raza, K., Afridi, D. F., & Khan, S. I. (2021). Impact of Training on Employees Performance and Job Satisfaction: An Empirical Study of Plastic Industry of Hayatabad Industrial Estate. *Journal of Business & Tourism*, 3(1), 113-129.
- Reed, J. E., Howe, C., Doyle, C., & Bell, D. (2018). Simple rules for evidence translation in complex systems: A qualitative study. *BMC Medicine*, 16(1), 221-235.
- Saad, R. A., Ahmi, A., Sawandi, N., & Aziz, N. M. (2023). Zakat administration reformation towards an effective and efficient zakat revenue generation. *Journal of Islamic Accounting and Business Research*, 155(3), 435-445.
- Saleem, T. S. (2019). The Extent of Devolution: A Comparative Analysis of Punjab and Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa Local Government Acts 2013. *Pakistan Institute of Development Economics (PIDE)*, 543(3), 223-245..