

The effect of Consumer Feedback on Consumer's Purchase Intention for online to offline Services: Mediating and Moderating Analysis

*Laraib

Abstract

The study inculcates the addition in the body of knowledge about the consumer feedback on consumer's purchase intentions for online to offline products or services. E-satisfaction through experiential values used as a mediator and service excellence as a moderator. 150 out of 180 valid questionnaires that were obtained from online to offline (O2O) consumers and having experience on online stores. The partial least square (PLS)-3 is used for measurement model and structural model for testing hypotheses. The findings suggested that the consumer feedback has a positive relationship with purchase intention in O2O goods. E-satisfaction through experiential value as a mediator significantly affects the purchase intentions and has partial association. Service excellence as a moderator enhanced the effect on the satisfaction and purchase intentions on store services of O2O products. This study demonstrated some suggestions for managers, marketers, and researchers for improving the consumer feedback and purchase intentions. Limitations of study are also discussed.

Keywords: Consumer Feedback, Purchase Intentions, E-Satisfaction, Service Excellence

1.Introduction

Digitalization has changed the world and the rise of numerous social shopping sites has pushed businessman to use large commercial range of social networking destinations aside concentrating on physical stores (Hu et al., 2016; Chiang, 2018). Business strategies are dependent on consumer experience in the form of values they received. In present, market has turned into a wellspring of focused separation as they give the likelihood of making an extraordinary brand by sustaining support and an enthusiastic connection with the consumer (Berry et al., 2002; Meyer & Schwager, 2007; Pentina, et al., 2011). The online to-offline (O2O) model, which is used by social shopping websites, is a business model, provides an easy-to-use channel to get information on goods, in which customers experimental focuses on its value for online purchase intentions (Pan et al., 2017). The customer online purchase intention is defined as the construct that gives the strength of a customer's intention to purchase online (Salisbury et al., 2001). A consumers' online acculturation preferences shape offline acculturation and how this in turn influences their purchase intention. Social media is an agent that facilitates ethnic minority consumers' identity in both online and offline contexts (Foroudi, Marvi, & Kizgin, 2020; Jafari & Visconti, 2015). Pavlou (2003) observed online purchase intention to be a more appropriate measure of intention to use a web site when assessing online consumer behavior. Social shopping websites provide many goods and services including basic needs, transportation, education, and entertainment. Users may be able to experience the cost of goods, get useful information, and understand of its customer value. Customer experiences are characterized as the enduring individual impressions that customer get upon first experiencing a product, service as well as organization, which they ideally take with them and convey to other people (Pine & Gilmore, 1998, 1999; Poulsson & Kale, 2004).

*OG-II Officer, Habib Bank Limited, Multan

In the modern era of technology advancement, experiential value has grown a unique attention for professional and researchers because they mainly focus on customer demand shifting, a lot of competition and numerous customer service satisfaction and services differentiation and feedback (Schmitt, 1999; Pine & Gilmore, 1998; Ponsonby & Boyle, 2004, Varshneya & Das, 2017). Experiential values provide the measurement of the values of different products and services that can be useful for evaluating the psychometric features of a specific sample and estimated the online goods shopping based on understanding the buying behavior of consumers (Mathwick et al., 2001; Varshneya & Das, 2017; Chiang, 2018). Customer e-experiences can likewise give essential data about customer preference, and organizations can utilize this data to improve their service. The service quality that impacts consumer e-satisfaction with their experience (Dube' et al., 1994; Robson, 1999; Sulek & Hensley, 2004).

According to Anderson and Srinivasan's (2003) e-satisfaction can be defined as “the contentment of a consumer with respect to his or her prior purchasing experiences with a given retail-oriented website.” Specifically, this concept provides the consumer review about the experience of product usage and psychological thinking that can affect the buying behavior of consumer for online or offline products or services. Mathwick, et al. (2002) researched the impact of natural plan on experiential value as service excellence.

Service excellence is delivering high levels of service that generates high customer satisfaction to its customers (Wirtz & Zeithaml, 2018). According to Mathwick et al. (2001), view of administration perfection depend on the dimension at which customers trust a store conveys its guarantees and expertly performs administration errands. Social shopping sites give numerous goods and services, including nourishment, garments, lodging, transportation, education, and entertainment. Consumers might almost certainly experience a goods' value, look for helpful data, and see its experiential value which create feedback and the intention towards online to offline purchase.

Consumer feedback is given by customers visiting a few sites, utilizing the different services offered on the sites, and posting messages (content or pictures) on those sites (Tong et al., 2013). Moreover, In the writing on customer service experiences and customer feedback, Shieh & Cheng (2007) examined a few investigations of the connection between customer experience satisfaction which leads towards the feedback and intention to purchase. Previously the examination of online and offline consumers' purchase intentions remained a topic of debate. Despite the emergence of digital technologies, the role of online acculturation preferences shaping offline acculturation preferences and how this informs consumer behavior is limited (Kizgin et al., 2018b; Kizgin et al., 2019).

The study aims to address and enhance the knowledge about the relationship between consumer feedback and purchase intentions of consumers with mediating role of e-Satisfaction through experiential values and service excellence as a moderator between e-satisfaction and purchase intentions among online to offline services for consumers. Masters level business university students of South Punjab was the unit of analysis who were using O2O shopping. The data collected in the last quarter of 2020. The selection of students in this study was due to their education, technology awareness and online shopping experience in comparison of least aware people in this regard.

Literature Review

Purchase intentions

Anderson & Srinivasan (2003) investigated the impacts of customer satisfaction in e-commerce and defined customer satisfaction as a customer's contentment with a prior purchasing experience with a given e-commerce firm. Dong, Chang, Liang, & Fan, (2018), explained that online media synergy influences consumers' purchase intention. Moreover, purchase intention is referred to as a consumer's subjective judgment following a general evaluation of the purchasing of products or services (Balakrishnan et al., 2014). Previous studies Mc Clure, & Seock, (2020) have investigated the relationship between consumer satisfaction and purchasing intentions (Oliver & DeSarbo, 1988). Szymanski & Hise (2000) examined the role of consumer perceptions on online purchase behavior in e-satisfaction assessments. Their results revealed that e-satisfaction was the most dominant factor for customers' purchase experiences.

Recent studies on shopping value have revealed a link between experiential shopping value and satisfaction for e-commerce (Alnawas & Aburub, 2016; Bressolles et al., 2014; Endo et al., 2012). Similarly, Nisar & Prabhakar (2017) stated that e-satisfaction is likely to be influenced by consumer spending and store service quality, which play significant roles. Furthermore, the relationship between e-satisfaction and purchase behavior is positive in online shopping (Pham & Ahammad, 2017). The past study of purchase behavior indicated that consumer satisfaction is a critical factor for the establishment of pleasurable customer experience. Many studies have found a positive relationship between consumer satisfaction and purchase intentions for e-commerce (Alnawas & Aburub, 2016; Hsu et al., 2017; Liao et al., 2017; Pham & Ahammad, 2017). Additionally, Riquelme et al. (2016) indicated that consumers' perceptions of satisfaction should include an evaluation of online and offline retail behavior." Overall, consumer satisfaction in the online shopping environment increases considerably when online satisfaction reduces complaints or return probability for online consumers, which thus influences purchase intentions for brick-and-mortar stores (Pan et al., 2017)".

Consumer Feedback:

Consumer feedback is given by customers visiting a few sites, utilizing the different services offered on the sites, and posting messages (content or pictures) on those sites (Tong et al., 2013). Kim & Kim, (2004) expressed that buyers' purchase intentions for online retailers can be influenced if those online retailers give definite product data, shopper audits, and an appealing store structure with quality pictures, which builds consumer loyalty. Also, numerous examinations have discovered that fulfillment is decidedly connected with purchaser criticism (de Haan, et al., 2015; Tong et al., 2013). In the investigation by Kim & Kim (2004), exceedingly fulfilled customers indicated more prominent experiential value for buy products from an online store with more input. Along these lines, buyer satisfaction was additionally observed to be a key driver of purchaser feedback (Furenes, et al., 2017). Moreover, Kim & Kim (2004) expressed that shoppers' buy goals for online retailers can be influenced if those online retailers give definite item data, purchaser surveys, and an alluring store structure with quality pictures, which expands consumer satisfaction.

Also, Hsiao et al. (2010) depict that the uses of social shopping, for example, eBay, and content from eBay.com joining eBay online journals, guides, reviews, what's more, item inquiry are consolidated into each eBay neighborhood. In the area's customers can join exchanges, meet other individuals who offer the comparative consumer interests, and effectively get to sites pages for item barterers. Style hive is another precedent for social shopping. It grants the consumers to

bookmark their ideal things, improve pictures, and share them with likeminded customers, family, and companions (Hsiao et al., 2010).

E-Satisfaction through experiential values.

According to Anderson and Srinivasan's (2003) E-satisfaction can be defined as “the contentment of a consumer with respect to his or her prior purchasing experiences with a given retail-oriented website.” The term experiential value is referred as there is shopping experienced and judge a product logically based on available information about the performance and function of products or services (Kim et al., 2007). Specifically, this concept provides the consumer review about the experience of product usage and psychological thinking that can affect the buying behavior of consumer for online or offline products or services. According to the study of Lee & Bang (2004), there is positively association between online shopping behavior and online experiential value (utilitarian) with consumer satisfaction. Likewise, Shieh & Cheng, (2017) explained the consumer behavioral model for teenagers and youngers that showed that there is positive association of experiential construct social functions and escapism with satisfaction in online goods and services. Moreover, according to the finding if Wu & Liang, (2009), the consumer perceived values and satisfaction have a positive association in service encounters for online goods. Though there is a lot of methods or techniques are suggested for the examination of consumer values and few researches examined the relationship between experiential values of consumer and its impact on customer e-satisfaction.

According to Cacioppo (2010), “customer satisfaction is judged by different things i.e., customers services, convenient location, shopping center convenience, store environment and brand variety as well. It also depends on the product quality, reliability of product, services either personnel or process and location. Customer satisfaction is resulted from the measuring product and service resulting from customer satisfaction, according to previous customer experiences as well as overall evaluation experience of customers. They showed that the enterprise provides a good service Quality can really meet different customer's needs, and customer satisfaction the customer's past evaluation and service was based on the past experiences about consumption

Target-oriented customers are motivated by more economical, efficient, and timely ways of shopping, pursuing the functional value of purchases. (Babin et al., 1994). Reflecting the utilitarian benefits sought by a client, the client's ROI dimension focuses on efficiency (saving time and effort) and monetary savings in the use of the product / service and excellence in service focuses on the overall evaluation of service performance (Mathwick et al., 2001).

Zeithaml (1988) contends that the perceived value of a trade-off between the benefits / costs or appearance, and the difference between the utility and disutility price paid by the attributes of a product or service.

Service Excellence

Service excellence characterized “as the level of an intrinsically receptive reaction to which a store in a perfect world performs and fills in as an extraneous standard incentive for judgment on quality. As per Mathwick et al. (2001), view of administration perfection depend on the dimension at which customers trust a store conveys its guarantees and expertly performs administration errands. In our investigation, saw estimation of greatness reflects product

execution and a summed-up buyer energy about a specialist co-op, (for example, a store) that shows skill and keeps up dependable administration” (Oliver & DeSarbo, 1988).

The extent of this scale advancement exertion was limited to the purchaser context, and managed Holbrook's (1994) "self-arranged" measurements of significant worth. The social measurement of value, alluded to by Holbrook (1994) as the "other situated" measurement stays unexplored. In both on and disconnected retail administration encounters, this component of significant worth is probably going to be a critical factor in forming impression of the utilization experience. Future scientists are urged to stretch out this work to join this additional measurement that incorporates status, morals, regard, and otherworldliness to catch Holbrook's full typology. It is trusted the scale improvement procedure and discoveries talked about here will be valuable in that future exertion.

Previously the examination of online and offline consumers' purchase intentions remained a topic of debate. Despite the emergence of digital technologies, the role of online acculturation preferences shaping offline acculturation preferences and how this informs consumer behavior is limited (Kizgin et al., 2018b; Kizgin et al., 2019).

Consumer satisfaction is a necessary but insufficient precursor of consumers' purchase intentions. "Purchase intentions may be strongly influenced by consumer feedback (Lim et al., 2016), whereas dissatisfied customers may retain some product benefits because of high consumer feedback. There is no previous study show the relationship between consumer feedback on e-Satisfaction, the relationship between consumer feedback and purchase intention, the relationship between Consumer feedback on e-Satisfaction with moderating role of Service excellence and the relationship between consumer feedback on purchase intention with mediating role of e-satisfaction.

Mediating role of e-satisfaction

Consumer feedback is attained by customers on website online, services provided by the company that is posted messages, image or text on websites (Tong et al., 2013). The purchase intention of consumer online from the will, that company is incapable of providing, if the detailed product information, reviews of consumer, to an attractive, and to be taken out of the abundance and the quality of the advice of the brand images, which is increased customer satisfaction (De Haan et al., 2015; Tong et al., 2013), there are research that found there is positive relationship of customer satisfaction and consumer feedback. In the study by Kim & Kim (2004), experience shows greater value highly satisfied consumers to purchase more goods from the store into an online feedback. Thus, the consumer satisfaction is also a key driver found consumer feedback (Furenes et al., 2017).

Customer satisfaction is the result of collective understanding, assess and customers, physiological movement for the taking of goods or services. Customer satisfaction is not only determined by the promoter, but also the properties of the product or service in the interaction with the system is the same for the entire agreement saved in the training (Moezzi, 2009).

Only decision of customer whether a website leads to the appearance of the shopping exciting and playful or not? Internet retailer's final decision and function. In particular, the game will be perceived as the effect on product quality and customer network of retailers and deeply considered in context. This meant that, customer perceived feedback begins when the customer

appreciates that quality of services is beyond their expectations. In return, there is necessary factors to enhance the purchase intention and customer satisfaction on basis of consumer feedback or desire to purchase (Ahem et al., 2007).

Moderating role of Service Excellence

According to the Swastika (2005: 3), service excellence contains three main points, namely their attitudes related to the approach to the customer care, efforts to serve the best course of action, and their aim to satisfy customers with standard orientation on certain service and customer delight (Thaher, 2017). The concept of customer delight which has been around for some time (Heskett et al., 1997) has only been recently recognized by some service delivery organizations for its significance and hence achieving customer delight or service excellence is being listed as their goal (Dharamdaas, 2018).

The increase of globalization of services has prompted corporations in various service industries to concentrate on achieving customer delight through service excellence because the delight fulness creates customer intentions more generously, which should enable them to secure their competitive position and customer loyalty (Gouthier et al., 2012). As such, service excellence can be perceived as a critical success factor for organizations however has been lacking the much-needed attention as a business goal thus far. The evolution of the contact center industry which is service driven has an urgent need to identify the determinants of service excellence. Service excellence provide organizations to investigate a deep customer preference. However, more customer preferences knowing will lead to compete better in market in comparison of competitors (Veitz & Zeithmal, 2018).

Service excellence as an organizational strategy of delivering high levels of service that generates high customer satisfaction to its customers.

Hypothesis

- H1: Consumer feedback has positive relationship with purchase intentions.**
- H2: Consumer feedback has positive effect on E-Satisfaction and E- Satisfaction has positive effect on Purchase Intention.**
- H3: There is a positive relationship between consumer feedback and purchase intention with mediating role of E-Satisfaction**
- H4: There is a positive relationship between consumer feedback and E-satisfaction (Experiential Value) with moderating role of service excellence**

2.7 Conceptual Framework



Research Methodology

A quantifiable research study administered with multiple item measures. Consumers who perceive that a shopping experience is more than an opportunity to buy, see that experience as something that should be savored and appreciated in all its nuances. The buyer is responding to the entertainment dimension of the aesthetic response. This chapter is about methods of study in which we follow the technique for proving the hypothesis.

3.2.1 Population

For investigating the recognized experiential value (e.g., service excellence) as determining purchase intentions for O2O goods. Prior studies have empirically validated the key role experiential factors play in affecting consumer satisfaction and purchase intentions in online shopping in south Punjab, we collected data from the master's level business university students of South Punjab population who are using O2O shopping. The reason because the student was surveyed is this study was due their education, technology awareness and online shopping experience is the highest among the youth. Therefore, undergraduate and post graduate students were considered as a population of this research.

3.2.2 Sample Size

To find conclusion, we collect data from south Punjab and sample size shall be determined based on available respondents and their interest in O2O purchases intention in universities of south Punjab regions of Pakistan. We collect about 150 responses from population.

3.2.3 Sample Techniques

The sample techniques that used, random sampling from university students. A questionnaire containing different variables questions will be distributed among the respondent which is related with 7 Likert scale from 1 is Very strongly disagree to 7 is very strongly agree.

3.3 Measurement of Variables

By using multi-item scales that is Likert, a quantifiable research is conducted and this is literature review base modelling, which is consisted only 5 questions for consumer feedback, 5 questions for purchase intention, 15 questions are developed for e satisfaction through experiential values containing 3 variables behinds this. There are five different questions, asked for the determination of customer satisfaction and moderator which is Service Excellence is determined by five questions. A high score for each indicator means there is high cross loading in data so that this is appropriate for the analysis for study further.

Measurement of Variables and References

Dimension	Questionnaire items	References
Service excellence (SE)	SE1: The O2O goods are exquisite. SE2: The service in the O2O store is attentive. SE3: Whenever I think of this O2O store, I appreciate its excellent service quality.	Mathwick et al. (2001). Varshneya & Das (2017)
e Satisfaction (e-SAT)	e-SAT1: I am satisfied when I receive excellent service and positivity. e-SAT2: I am satisfied with the quality of the O2O goods. e-SAT3: The O2O goods satisfied my needs.	Endo et al. (2012) Szymanski & Hise (2000)
Purchase intention (PI)	PI1: I am willing to purchase O2O goods. PI2: I will recommend O2O goods to others. PI3: I am willing to recommend O2O goods when other people ask for suggestions. PI4: I will try to buy luxury fashion goods in future. PI5: I intend to purchase luxury fashion goods within next year. PI6: The probability that I would buy luxury fashion brands within the next 12 months is high.	Szymanski & Hise (2000) Hu et al. (2016) Madden, Ellen, & Ajzen (1992); Ajzen (1991)
Consumer feedback (CF)	CF1: When I purchase an O2O good, I want to give feedback to the store. CF2: When I purchase an O2O good, I will recommend it to others. CF3: The service quality of sellers is important. CF4: So far, I am satisfied with the speed of delivery for online shops.	Tong et al. (2013)

3.4 Data Analysis Techniques

Data will be analyzed with the help of software PLS (Partial Least Square) after collecting from population so that following test will be applied.

3.4.1 Data Screening

First step to test the accuracy and validity of data is to composed the data as such way we can analyze for testing of hypothesis according to manner of Tabachnick, Fidell, & Osterlind, (2001). In this step, we find the missing values in data and this is useful for further analysis. The software we used for analysis, assumed that data is normality distributed and properties of

distribution are fulfilled into account according to Hair, et al., (2016) study. The analysis is conducted by using SPSS and PLS Smart.

Analysis

For analysis of the study, firstly we explained the descriptive statistics for data which contains 150 responses from south region of Pakistan. The demographics or basic information obtained from questions is as follow:

4.1 Descriptive Statistics

Table 1
Descriptive Statistics of whole sample

Profiles	Particulars	Frequency	Percentage
Gender	Male	87	58%
	Female	63	42%
Age	Below 20	49	33%
	21-30	44	29%
	31-40	44	29%
	41-50	10	7%
	51 above	03	2%
Education	University Level	78	52%
	College Level	72	48%
Industry type	General service industry	38	25%
	General manufacturing	37	25%
	General financial industry	36	24%
	Food and catering industry	35	23%
	Leisure and entertainment industry	04	3%
How long have you experienced O2O goods? (Year)	1~2	49	33%
	2~3	48	32%
	3~4	46	31%
	4~5	07	5%
How much experienced O2O goods for a day? (Hour)	1~2	62	41%
	3~4	33	22%
	5~6	44	29%
	7~8	06	4%
	8 above	05	3%

4.2 Cross Loading

According to the criteria for above test, the author explained that extra judgment of the validity for the constructs, there's called discriminant validity test (Bagozzi et al., 1991). For the cross-loading table, all values are greater in the variable which have questions, if there is a value that is greater than the main variable loading this is an issue of validity in the data (Götz et al., 2010; Pearson et al., 2011). The cross section of each variable must be lied in the variable table that is validity confirmation among data. The values are shown in the table so all variable meet the criterion of author mentioned above.

Coded Variables	Consumer Feedback	E-Satisfaction	Purchase Intention	Service Excellence
CF1	0.730			
CF2	0.697			
CF3	0.632			
CF4	0.667			
ESAT1		0.681		
ESAT2		0.735		
ESAT3		0.589		
ESAT4		0.614		
ESAT5		0.635		
PI1			0.713	
PI2			0.473	
PI3			0.636	
PI4			0.688	
PI5			0.662	
SE1				0.680
SE2				0.653
SE3				0.629
SE4				0.573
SE5				0.671

4.3 Latent Variable Correlation

Latent variable table 3 basically demonstrates the explanation of co-variances between the observable variables in term of smaller indicators that are unseen but presumed. We can predict with uncorrelated factors that test the fit of the model by allowing the factors to correlate with others. This explains the correlation between two variables but the original factor will show cent percent relationship with each other's.

Variables	Consumer Feedback	E-Satisfaction	Purchase Intention	Service Excellence
Consumer Feedback	1.000			
E-Satisfaction	0.602	1.000		
Purchase Intention	0.619	0.694	1.000	

Service Excellence	0.697	0.705	0.647	1.000
--------------------	-------	-------	-------	-------

Reliability and Validity Tests

There is a quantity measurement in data (the principles of classic test), the (AVE) measure is captured by the construction of different types of variables due to the error. It must be greater than 0.40. According to results of the study, all variables meet the criteria of AVE. Every indicator of each variable is used for study a construct so the external loading is also explored in the study by using software. We use evaluating the reliability for construction using both Cronbach's Alpha and Comprehensive reliability scores.

Composite reliability (sometimes called construct reliability) is a measure of internal consistency in scale items, much like Cronbach's alpha (Netemeyer, 2003). It can be thought of as being equal to the total amount of true score variance relative to the total scale score variance (Brunner & Süß, 2005). In the constructs of model, there are greater than 0.7 composite reliability values which meets the criteria of reliability so we can further analyze the data. The results of Cronbach's are greater than 0.60 so there is reliability of data according to this test, this is low due to lack of data.

Table 4
Results of Measurement Model

Variables	Cronbach's Alpha	Composite Reliability	Average Variance Extracted (AVE)
Consumer Feedback	0.616	0.777	0.466
E-Satisfaction	0.663	0.787	0.426
Purchase Intention	0.632	0.773	0.409
Service Excellence	0.647	0.778	0.413

4.5.1 Discriminant Validity

4.4.1.1 Fornell-Larcker Criterion

Campbell and Fiske (1959) introduced the concept of discriminant validity within their discussion on evaluating test validity. They stressed the importance of using both discriminant and convergent validation techniques when assessing new tests. A successful evaluation of discriminant validity shows that a test of a concept is not highly correlated with other tests designed to measure theoretically different concepts. "Convergent and discriminant validity are considered subcategories or subtypes of validity of the design." It is important to recognize that they work together: if you can show that you have evidence of convergent and discriminant validity, then you have shown that you have proof of the validity of the structure. But not one is enough to establish the validity of the design.

Another criterion of validity in data is Fornell-Larcker test which is same like correlation matrix but this shows exact relationship between two variables so it can be judged by cross loading analysis. The value of each variable, must be lie in the variable table which is actual. If there is greater value in the construct other than main variable it means there is issue in the constructs.

Table 5

Variables	Consumer Feedback	E-Satisfaction	Purchase Intention_	Service Excellence
Consumer Feedback	0.682			
E-Satisfaction	0.602	0.653		
Purchase Intention_	0.619	0.694	0.640	
Service Excellence	0.697	0.705	0.647	0.643

4.1.1.2 Regression Results (Path Coefficients)

H1: Consumer feedback has positive relationship with purchase intention.

Table 6

Coefficients	Original Sample (O)	Sample Mean (M)	Standard Deviation (STDEV)	T Statistics (O/STDEV)	P Values
Consumer Feedback - > Purchase Intention	0.627	0.643	0.042	15.014	0.000

In the above table 6, we used bootstrapping for significant values in PLS Smart 3. In this hypothesis we used purchase intention as dependent variable and consumer feedback as independent variable, we check the indirect relationship between them. The results concluded that there is positive significant relationship between consumer feedback and purchase intention.

Hypothesis 2: There is positive relationship between E-Satisfaction and Purchase Intention.

Table 7

Coefficients	Original Sample (O)	Sample Mean (M)	Standard Deviation (STDEV)	T Statistics (O/STDEV)	P Values
E-Satisfaction -> Purchase Intention_	0.70	0.71	0.04	19.81	0.00
R Square				0.485	

In the above table 7, we check the relationship between purchase intention and E-Satisfaction in which purchase intention is dependent variable and e-satisfaction as independent variable in the first hypothesis, the results conclude that there is positive significant relationship between E-

satisfaction and purchase intention in southern region it means if the customer is satisfied with product and services we will purchase positively in future and vice versa.

Hypothesis 3: There is a positive relationship between consumer feedback and purchase intention with mediating role of E-Satisfaction

Table 8

	Original Sample (O)	Sample Mean (M)	Standard Deviation (STDEV)	T Statistics (O/STDEV)	P Values
Consumer Feedback -> E-Satisfaction	0.604	0.617	0.046	13.106	0.000
Consumer Feedback ->Purchase Intention_	0.315	0.321	0.075	4.206	0.000
E-Satisfaction -> Purchase Intention_	0.503	0.503	0.072	6.960	0.000

From above analysis, we test the mediating association of e-satisfaction between consumer feedback and purchase intention. We used VAF (Variance Accounted For) for mediation analysis. The above results are obtained from bootstrapping but the results of mediation are attained from VAF which is calculated as percentage of total indirect effect to total effect of variables. According to results, if your VAR is between 0.20 it means there is no mediation, it lies between 0.20 and 0.80 there is partial mediation, if the value is greater than 0.80 there is full mediation, the results are shown in the table Hair et al., 2014. The formula for VAR technique is total indirect effect to total effect of model by using mediator as ES Hair et al. (2016). According to results, there is partial mediation available between purchase intention and consumer feedback in online and offline goods.

Hypothesis	Relationship	Indirect effect	Total Effect	Standard Deviation	T-Value	VA F*	Results
H4	Consumer feedback>E-Satisfaction>Purchase Intention	0.304	0.627	0.075	4.206	0.48	Partial Mediation

Hypothesis 4: There is a positive relationship between consumer feedback and E-satisfaction (Experiential Value) with moderating role of service excellence

Table 9

Coefficients	Original Sample (O)	Sample Mean (M)	Standard Deviation	T Statistics (O/STDEV)	P Values
--------------	---------------------	-----------------	--------------------	--------------------------	----------

			(STDEV)		
Consumer Feedback -> E-Satisfaction	0.276	0.273	0.078	3.515	0.000
Consumer Feedback ->Purchase Intention	0.316	0.323	0.074	4.273	0.000
E-Satisfaction ->Purchase Intention	0.503	0.504	0.071	7.076	0.000
Moderating Effect 1 -> E-Satisfaction	0.342	0.323	0.076	4.469	0.000
Service Excellence -> E-Satisfaction	0.537	0.544	0.075	7.111	0.000
R Square E-Satisfaction	0.584				
R Square Purchase Intention	0.548				

In the above table 9, there is two model one is linked with consumer feedback and e-satisfaction and other is e-satisfaction and purchase intention. In the hypothesis, we used service excellence as moderating effect which may influence the results of existing relationships. According to results, there is moderating effect in the study which increased and made a strong relationship between variables, enhanced the R-square which make strong relationship between consumer feedback and e-satisfaction as well as purchase intention of south Punjab region of Pakistan.

Table 10
Hypothesis Testing

Hypothesis	Relationships	Original Sample (O)	Sample Mean (M)	Standard Deviation (STDEV)	T Statistics ((O/STDEV))	P Values	Significant / Not Significant
H1	Consumer Feedback -> E-Satisfaction	0.604	0.617	0.046	13.106	0	Significant
H2	E-Satisfaction -> Purchase Intention	0.7	0.71	0.04	19.81	0	Significant
H3	Moderating Effect 1 -> E-Satisfaction	0.342	0.323	0.076	4.469	0	Significant

Hypothesis	Relationship	Indirect effect	Total Effect	Standard Deviation	T-Value	VAF*	Significant / Not Significant
H4	Consumer feedback>E-Satisfaction>Purchase Intention	0.304	0.627	0.075	4.206	0.48	Partial Mediation

5. Discussion

The objective of this research was to suggested and validated the research model which is purchase intention and consumer feedback with mediating role of e-satisfaction and moderating effect of service excellence (Experiential value). We analyzed the different relationship with variable like consumer feedback with e-satisfaction, e-satisfaction with purchase intention,

mediating effect of e-satisfaction between consumer feedback and purchase intention and moderating effect of service excellence with them also.

Firstly, we explored the relationship between consumer feedback and satisfaction, the results showed that there is positive and significant relationship exist between them. This means if the feedback is higher, then the customer will more satisfied in online and offline goods or services. The result has a greater descriptive power for purchase intentions and O2O spending behavior than previous studies. Secondly, we examined the relationship between e-satisfaction with purchase intention, the results showed that there is positive and significant association existed in them so if the customer is satisfied then he/she will buy that product in future and vice versa. Thus, e-satisfaction and purchase intentions have a strong positive relationship, which is in accordance with the results of Alnawas & Aburub (2016). At the third point of analysis, we analyzed the moderating effect of service excellence which is service excellence, the results showed that there is moderating effect in the relationship of consumer feedback and e-satisfaction as well as purchase intention. Service excellence made strong relationship among variables due to increase in R square. This result is consistent with that of Wu & Liang (2009), who claimed that service excellence entices potential consumers and enhances brand awareness and brand image in the minds of consumers. Lastly, we analyzed that there is mediating effect of e-satisfaction between consumer feedback and purchase intention, the results showed that there is partial mediation in model so this is theoretically correct and supported this model (Hsu et al., 2017) showed that satisfaction with goods matches consumers' needs and influences consumers' purchase intentions. We propose that consumers can contribute to satisfaction levels if they are given an opportunity to provide and read feedback for O2O goods or services.

Conclusion and Recommendations

The objective of the study was to test the association among consumer feedback, e-satisfaction, and service excellence and purchase intention. Here we used e-satisfaction as a mediator also and service excellence as moderator in this study e-satisfaction was used which is most important mediator for the promotion of consumer feedback and purchase intention during online and offline goods and services. First, consumer feedback is positively influenced by e-satisfaction, but there is also positive linked with consumer feedback and purchase intention indirectly. If the customer is satisfied, he will give a positive feedback or vice versa in online and offline commerce. Furthermore, service excellence as experiential value regarding consumer's favorite goods and services and consumer feedback on offline and online good can improve the purchase intention of other customers. The limitations of the study, this research did not explain the types of products or brands which a consumer is using by o2o website in Pakistan south Punjab regions. As a result, there cannot be generalize the results of the study as a whole Pakistan or other countries because they don't provide purchase intention and consumer feedback for all online websites. This study recommends to scholars that future researches may be conducted on different types of products, brands or online feedback system such as foods items, software, computer, communication and electronics Medias. In this research, after or before sales services is not considered, we just check the experiential marketing factors. In future, we will consider this variable and combine the other theories like brand image and word to mouth factors, with using of gratification theory. The application of research in Pakistan, there are some implications available for academicians, firstly, previous study focused on purchase intention and consumer

feedback in electronic commerce system and the finding of this study implement the practical implication for online and offline companies and managers to intent the customer for purchasing of online and offline goods.

References

- McClure, C., & Seock, Y. K. (2020). The role of involvement: Investigating the effect of brand's social media pages on consumer purchase intention. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 53, 101975.
- Moran, N. (2020). Illusion of safety: How consumers underestimate manipulation and deception in online (vs. offline) shopping contexts. *Journal of Consumer Affairs*, 54(3), 890-911.
- Wang, O., Somogyi, S., & Charlebois, S. (2020). Food choice in the e-commerce era: a comparison between Business-To-Consumer (B2C), Online-To-Offline (O2O) and new retail. *British Food Journal*, 122(4), 1215-1237.
- Kizgin, H., Jamal, A., Dwivedi, Y. K., & Rana, N. P. (2020). The impact of online vs. offline acculturation on purchase intentions: A multigroup analysis of the role of education. *Journal of Business Research*.
- Souiden, N., Amara, N., & Chaouali, W. (2020). Optimal image mix cues and their impacts on consumers' purchase intention. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 54, 102011.
- Wirtz, J., & Zeithaml, V. (2018). Cost-effective service excellence. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 46(1), 59-80.
- Chiang, C. H. (2018). Experiential Value affects Purchase Intentions for Online-to-Offline Goods: Consumer Feedback as a Mediator. *Journal of Marketing Management*, 6(2), 10-24.
- Dong, X., Chang, Y., Liang, S., & Fan, X. (2018). How online media synergy influences consumers' purchase intention. *Internet Research*.
- Alnawas, I., & Aburub, F. (2016). The effect of benefits generated from interacting with branded mobile apps on consumer satisfaction and purchase intentions. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 31, 313-322.
- Balakrishnan, B. K., Dahnil, M. I., & Yi, W. J. (2014). The impact of social media marketing medium toward purchase intention and brand loyalty among generation Y. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 148, 177-185.
- De Haan, E., Verhoef, P. C., & Wiesel, T. (2015). The predictive ability of different customer feedback metrics for retention. *International Journal of Research in Marketing*, 32(2), 195-206.
- Filieri, R., McLeay, F., Tsui, B., & Lin, Z. (2018). Consumer perceptions of information helpfulness and determinants of purchase intention in online consumer reviews of services. *Information & Management*, 55(8), 956-970.
- Furenes, M. I., Øgaard, T., & Gjerald, O. (2017). How face-to-face feedback influences guest outcome evaluation of co-production: Changing or shaping guest experiences? *Tourism Management Perspectives*, 21(January), 59-65.
- Hsiao, Y. H., Chen, M. C., & Liao, W. C. (2017). Logistics service design for cross-border E-commerce using Kansei engineering with text-mining-based online content analysis. *Telematics and Informatics*, 34(4), 284-302.
- Hu, N., Koh, N. S., & Reddy, S. K. (2014). Ratings lead you to the product, reviews help you clinch it? The mediating role of online review sentiments on product sales. *Decision support systems*, 57, 42-53.
- Hu, X., Huang, Q., Zhong, X., Davison, R. M., & Zhao, D. (2016). The influence of peer characteristics and technical features of a social shopping website on a consumer's purchase intention. *International Journal of Information Management*, 36(6), 1218-1230.

- Kong, L., Liu, Z., Pan, Y., Xie, J., & Yang, G. (2017). Pricing and service decision of dual-channel operations in an O2O closed-loop supply chain. *Industrial Management & Data Systems*, 117(8), 1567-1588.
- Lau, P. Y. Y., Tong, J. L. T., Lien, B. Y. H., Hsu, Y. C., & Chong, C. L. (2017). Ethical work climate, employee commitment and proactive customer service performance: Test of the mediating effects of organizational politics. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 35, 20-26.
- Hair, Jr, J. F., Sarstedt, M., Matthews, L. M., & Ringle, C. M. (2016). Identifying and treating unobserved heterogeneity with FIMIX-PLS: part I—method. *European Business Review*, 28(1), 63-76.
- Varshneya, G., & Das, G. (2017). Experiential value: Multi-item scale development and validation. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 34(January), 48-57.
- Liao, C., Lin, H. N., Luo, M. M., & Chea, S. (2017). Factors influencing online shoppers' repurchase intentions: The roles of satisfaction and regret. *Information & Management*, 54(5), 651-668.
- Lim, Y. J., Osman, A., Salahuddin, S. N., Romle, A. R., & Abdullah, S. (2016). Factors influencing online shopping behavior: the mediating role of purchase intention. *Procedia economics and finance*, 35, 401-410.
- Nisar, T. M., & Prabhakar, G. (2017). What factors determine e-satisfaction and consumer spending in e-commerce retailing?. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 39, 135-144.
- Pappas, I. O., Kourouthanassis, P. E., Giannakos, M. N., & Lekakos, G. (2017). The interplay of online shopping motivations and experiential factors on personalized e-commerce: A complexity theory approach. *Telematics and Informatics*, 34(5), 730-742.
- Pham, T. S. H., & Ahammad, M. F. (2017). Antecedents and consequences of online customer satisfaction: A holistic process perspective. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, 124(November), 332-342.
- Dennis, C., Brakus, J. J., Gupta, S., & Alamanos, E. (2014). The effect of digital signage on shoppers' behavior: The role of the evoked experience. *Journal of Business research*, 67(11), 2250-2257.
- Qazi, A., Raj, R., Hardaker, G., & Standing, C. (2017). A systematic literature review on opinion types and sentiment analysis techniques: Tasks and challenges. *Internet Research*, 27(3).
- Radojevic, T., Stanic, N., & Stanic, N. (2015). Ensuring positive feedback: Factors that influence customer satisfaction in the contemporary hospitality industry. *Tourism Management*, 51, 13-21.
- Thaher, O. (2017). *The Effect Of Service Excellence On Customer Satisfaction* (Doctoral dissertation, Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta).
- Thaichon, P., Lobo, A., & Mitsis, A. (2014). Achieving customer loyalty through service excellence in internet industry. *International Journal of Quality and Service Sciences*.
- Ahmed, Z. U., Ghingold, M., & Dahari, Z. (2007). Malaysian shopping mall behavior: an exploratory study. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 19(4), 331-348.
- Ajzen, I. (1991). The theory of planned behavior. *Organizational behavior and human decision processes*, 50(2), 179-211.
- Anderson, R. E., & Srinivasan, S. S. (2003). E-satisfaction and e-loyalty: A contingency framework. *Psychology & marketing*, 20(2), 123-138.
- Babin, Barry J., William R. Darden, and Mitch Griffin. 1994. "Work and/or Fun: Measuring Hedonic and Utilitarian Shopping Value." *Journal of Consumer Research* 20 (Spring): 644-656.
- Berry, L.L., Carbone, L.P. and Haeckel, S.H. (2002), "Managing the total customer experience", *MIT Sloan Management Review*, Vol. 43 No. 3, pp. 85-89.

- Bressolles, G., Durrieu, F., & Senecal, S. (2014). A consumer typology based on e-service quality and e-satisfaction. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 21(6), 889-896.
- Brunner, M., & Süß, H. M. (2005). Analyzing the reliability of multidimensional measures: An example from intelligence research. *Educational and Psychological Measurement*, 65(2), 227-240.
- Cacioppo, Kevin. (2010), Measuring and Managing customer satisfaction. Quality Digest.
- Cheng, C. C., Chen, C. T., Hsu, F. S., & Hu, H. Y. (2012). Enhancing service quality improvement strategies of fine-dining restaurants: New insights from integrating a two-phase decision-making model of IPGA and DEMATEL analysis. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 31(4), 1155-1166.
- Cheung, C. M., Lee, M. K., & Rabjohn, N. (2008). The impact of electronic word-of-mouth: The adoption of online opinions in online customer communities. *Internet research*, 18(3), 229-247.
- Dominici, G., & Guzzo, R. (2010). Customer satisfaction in the hotel industry: a case study from Sicily. *International Journal of Marketing Studies*, 2(2), 3-12.
- Dube', L., Renaghan, L.M., Miller, J.M., 1994. Measuring customer satisfaction for strategic management. *Cornell Hotel and Restaurant Administration Quarterly* 35 (1), 39-47.
- Endo, S., Yang, J., & Park, J. (2012). The investigation on dimensions of e-satisfaction for online shoes retailing. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 19(4), 398-405.
- F. Hair Jr, J., Sarstedt, M., Hopkins, L., & G. Kuppelwieser, V. (2014). Partial least squares structural equation modeling (PLS-SEM) An emerging tool in business research. *European Business Review*, 26(2), 106-121.
- Götz, O., Liehr-Gobbers, K., & Krafft, M. (2010). Evaluation of structural equation models using the partial least squares (PLS) approach. In *Handbook of partial least squares* (pp. 691-711). Springer, Berlin, Heidelberg.
- Hair, J. F., Ringle, C. M., & Sarstedt, M. (2011). PLS-SEM: Indeed a silver bullet. *Journal of Marketing theory and Practice*, 19(2), 139-152.
- Holbrook, Morris B. (1994). The Nature of Customer Value: An Axiology of Services in the Consumption Experience, pp. 21-71 in *Service Quality: New Directions in Theory and Practice*, Roland T. Rust and Richard L. Oliver, (Eds.), Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Hsiao, K. L., Chuan-Chuan Lin, J., Wang, X. Y., Lu, H. P., & Yu, H. (2010). Antecedents and consequences of trust in online product recommendations: An empirical study in social shopping. *Online Information Review*, 34(6), 935-953.
- Joseph Jr, F., Black, W. C., Babin, B. J., & Anderson Rolph, E. (2010). *Multivariate data analysis*. Pearson Education.
- Keng, C. J., Huang, T. L., Zheng, L. J., & Hsu, M. K. (2007). Modeling service encounters and customer experiential value in retailing: An empirical investigation of shopping mall customers in Taiwan. *International Journal of Service Industry Management*, 18(4), 349-367.
- Kim, E. Y., & Kim, Y. K. (2004). Predicting online purchase intentions for clothing products. *European Journal of Marketing*, 38(7), 883-897.
- Lee, C. S.; Bang, S. B. 2004. The effects of shopping value on online purchasing intention: focus on product attribute importance as intervening variables, *Korean Marketing Research* 19(2): 41-69.
- Lutzenhiser, L., Cesafsky, L., Chappells, H., Gossard, M., Moezzi, M., Moran, D., ... & Wilhite, H. (2009). Behavioral assumptions underlying California residential sector energy efficiency programs. *Prepared for the California Institute for Energy and Environment Behavior and Energy Program*.



- Madden, T. J., Ellen, P. S., & Ajzen, I. (1992). A comparison of the theory of planned behavior and the theory of reasoned action. *Personality and social psychology Bulletin*, 18(1), 3-9.
- Mathwick, C., Malhotra, N. and Rigdon, E. (2001), "Experiential value: conceptualization, measurement and application in the catalog and internet shopping environment", *Journal of Retailing*. 2001, Vol. 77, pp. 39-56.
- Meyer, C., & Schwager, A. (2007). Understanding customer experience. *Harvard business review*, 85(2), 116.
- Narva, K. E., Schnepf, H. E., Knuth, M., Pollard, M. R., Cardineau, G., & Schwab, G. E. (2000). *U.S. Patent No. 6,083,499*. Washington, DC: U.S. Patent and Trademark Office.
- Netemeyer, R. G., Bearden, W. O., & Sharma, S. (2003). *Scaling procedures: Issues and applications*. Sage Publications.
- Pine, B. J. II., & Gilmore, J. H. (1998). Welcome to the experience economy. *Harvard Business Review*, 76(4), 97-105.
- Oh, H., Fiore, A.M. and Jeung, M. (2007), "Measuring experience economy concepts: tourism applications", *Journal of Travel Research*, Vol. 46-119.
- Oliver, R. L., & DeSarbo, W. S. (1988). Response determinants in satisfaction judgments. *Journal of consumer research*, 14(4), 495-507.
- Ponsonby, S., Boyle, E., 2004. The 'Value Of Marketing' and 'The Marketing Of Value' in contemporary times—a literature review and research agenda. *Journal of Marketing Management*. 20 (3-4), 343-361.
- Poullsson, S. H., & Kale, S. H. (2004). The experience economy and commercial experiences. *The marketing review*, 4(3), 267-277.
- Pavlou, P. A. (2003). Consumer acceptance of electronic commerce: Integrating trust and risk with the technology acceptance model. *International journal of electronic commerce*, 7(3), 101-134.
- Pentina, I., Amialchuk, A., & Taylor, D. G. (2011). Exploring effects of online shopping experiences on browser satisfaction and e-tail performance. *International Journal of Retail & Distribution Management*, 39(10), 742-758.
- Qazi, A., Fayaz, H., Wadi, A., Raj, R. G., Rahim, N. A., & Khan, W. A. (2015). The artificial neural network for solar radiation prediction and designing solar systems: a systematic literature review. *Journal of cleaner production*, 104, 1-12.
- Riquelme, S., Varas, M., Valenzuela, C., Vellozo, P., Chahin, N., Aguilera, P., et al. (2016). Relevant genes linked to virulence are required for *Salmonella* Typhimurium to survive intracellularly in the social amoeba *Dictyostelium discoideum*. *Front. Microbiol.* 7:1305. doi: 10.3389/fmicb.2016.01305
- Robson, S.K.A., 1999. Turning the tables: the psychology of design for high-volume restaurants. *Cornell Hotel and Restaurant Administration Quarterly* 40 (3), 56-63.
- Salisbury, W. D., Pearson, R. A., Pearson, A. W., & Miller, D. W. (2001). Perceived security and World Wide Web purchase intention. *Industrial Management & Data Systems*.
- Schmitt, B.H. (1999), *Experiential Marketing. How to Get Customers to Sense, Feel, Think, Act, Relate to Your Company and Brands*, The Free Press, New York, NY.
- Shieh, K. F., & Cheng, M. S. (2007). An empirical study of experiential value and lifestyles and their effects on satisfaction in adolescents: an example using online gaming. *Adolescence*, 42(165).
- Su, A. Y. L. (2004). Customer satisfaction measurement practice in Taiwan hotels. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 23(4), 397-408.



- Sulek, J. M., & Hensley, R. L. (2004). The relative importance of food, atmosphere, and fairness of wait: The case of a full-service restaurant. *Cornell Hotel and Restaurant Administration Quarterly*, 45(3), 235-247.
- Szymanski, D. M., & Hise, R. T. (2000). E-satisfaction: an initial examination. *Journal of retailing*, 76(3), 309-322.
- Tabachnick, B. G., Fidell, L. S., & Osterlind, S. J. (2001). Using multivariate. *New York: Statistics*.
- Tong, L., Zheng, Y., & Zhao, P. (2013). Is money really the root of all evil? The impact of priming money on consumer choice. *Marketing Letters*, 24(2), 119-129.
- Tsao, W. C., Hsieh, M. T., Ye, J. S. & Tsai, C. H. (2014). Loyalty or defection? An Application of equity theory on service recovery in Hospitality Industry: A star rating perspective. *Conference on Sustainable Operation and Development Technology Innovation and Management in a Global Era*, LIM007.
- Wu, C. H. J., & Liang, R. D. (2009). Effect of experiential value on customer satisfaction with service encounters in luxury-hotel restaurants. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 28(4), 586-593.
- Yaseen, A. (2015). Collaborative innovation in the Pakistan's dairy industry: effectiveness of managerial leadership and organizational readiness.
- Yoo, S. J., Park, J. B., & Choi, Y. H. (2007). Adaptive dynamic surface control for stabilization of parametric strict-feedback nonlinear systems with unknown time delays. *IEEE Transactions on Automatic Control*, 52(12), 2360-2365.
- Zeithaml, Valerie A. (1988). Consumer Perceptions of Price, Quality, and Value: A Means-End Model and Synthesis of Evidence. *Journal of Marketing*, 52(July), 2-22.